Welcome to the fourth issue of *Peregrinations*. In this issue, we are honored to have Gerhard Lutz serve as guest editor for a series of fascinating articles presenting the most innovative research on pilgrimage architecture in the later Middle Ages. Lutz deftly sets out the issues facing researchers in this area. This introduction is followed by three articles by Andreas Förderer, Gerhard Weilandt, and Mitchell Merback which showcase a thorough and contextual study of late medieval pilgrimage churches, concentrating on the merging of their architectural form and their cultic function. Vibeke Olsen then sums up the state of the research and offers suggestions as to what new ideas scholars might explore in this rapidly-changing field.

Separate from this scholarly core, this issue features articles introducing the KUNera database of pilgrim souvenirs and secular badges, the emergence of medieval art blogs, featured websites (the History of Italian Cities and the Pewter Society), short notices on new archaeological and architectural discoveries, and reviews of books and conferences. Our photobank continues to grow, with copyright free images of exceptional quality. Beginning with this issue, we have added a request/community bulletin board, where scholars can request specific images from fellow art historians and lovers of medieval art. Also established in this issue is an on-going series of stunning photos of the Architecture on the Pilgrimage Road to Santiago de Compostela taken by William J. Smither – all downloadable for use in research and teaching.

For future issues we are actively seeking articles on any aspect of medieval art and architecture, including: long and short scholarly articles, scholarly book reviews, review articles on issues facing the field of medieval art history, interesting notes and announcements, useful website recommendations, new archeological discoveries, and recent museum acquisitions as well as calls for papers and conference listings. We are interested in publishing articles that will undergo double-blind review and articles that are the result of preliminary research. We are also looking for images to add to our photobank, to be shared and used by art historians in the classroom and in their research. To round out the scholarly portion of the journal, we are also seeking short, amusing excerpts from medieval sources, poorly-worded student papers, comments on the Middle Ages in movies, etc.

Again, welcome to *Peregrinations*. Any suggestions or comments you have concerning the journal would be most welcome. Please feel free to e-mail us at: blicks@kenyon.edu or rtekippe@westga.edu.
Our grateful appreciation and thanks for partial funding provided by the Mrs. Giles Whiting Foundation.

Designer and Coordinator: Scott E. Pringle
Webmaster: Erin Ellingwood

**Current Issue:** Vol. 1, Issue 4

- Vol. 1, Issue 3
- Vol. 1, Issue 2
- Vol. 1, Issue 1
IN THIS ISSUE

ARTICLES

SPECIAL SECTION: PILGRIMAGE ARCHITECTURE IN NORTHERN EUROPE, WITH GUEST EDITOR, GERHARD LUTZ.

Introduction to Late Medieval Pilgrimage Architecture
By Gerhard Lutz

The Pilgrimage Church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port and its Late Medieval Furnishings
By Andreas Förderer

Pilgrimage in the Medieval City. The Example of Nuremberg in the 15th Century
By Gerhard Weilandt

The Vanquished Synagogue, the Risen Host, and the Grateful Dead at the Salvatorkirche in Passau
By Mitchell B. Merback

Late Medieval Pilgrimage Architecture in Northern Europe, c. 1250-1520: A Summary of Recent Research and New Perspectives
By Vibeke Olson

FEATURES

Kunera: A Dutch Saint and a Database of Badges and Ampullae
By Hanneke van Asperen

Blogging the Medieval Revolution
By Sarah Blick

SHORT NOTICES & ANNOUNCEMENTS

→ Wealth of Medieval Hebrew Manuscripts Uncovered in Spain
→ An Armrest for Charlemagne
→ Fifteenth-Century Tunnel Re-Opened at Canterbury Cathedral
FEATURED WEBSITES

International Study Centre for the History of Cities
By Alessandro Camiz

The Pewter Society
By Peter Hayward

REVIEWS

Review of Dee Dyas, Pilgrimage in Medieval English Literature, 700-1500, D.S. Brewer (2001)
By William Klein

Conference Review of Jornadas sobre San Martin de Frómista; ¿Paradigma o Historicismo?, Frómista, Spain, Sept. 17-18, 2004
By Therese Martin

PHOTO-ESSAY

From the Pilgrimage Road to Santiago de Compostela, Stunning images of the Architecture in Puente la Reina, Spain
By William J. Smither

PHOTO-BANK

Our on-going and ever-growing collection of copyright-free images. Your contributions and download use are both welcomed and encouraged.

PHOTO-SHARE

New! Beginning with this issue, an image-request source for art historians.

OFFERS OF INTEREST TO OUR READERS

Special discount on the new publication, Art and Architecture of Late Medieval Pilgrimage in Northern Europe and the British Isles.

Introduction to Late Medieval Pilgrimage Architecture

By Gerhard Lutz

In recent years studies on the functional and liturgical aspects of late medieval churches have evolved as a central topic of historical and art-historical scholarship. The furnishings of a church, such as panels, sculptures, tapestries, and precious books are no longer understood as separate artistic expressions, but are placed into a context of contemporaneous piety and theology. One recent focal point for such scholarship was female monasticism,¹ but the scattered scrutiny of pilgrimage architecture has not yet been subject to this kind of synthesis.²

This introduction seeks to outline the reasons for this significant absence of research and to develop some possible questions for further studies in this field. An art historical approach to late medieval pilgrimage architecture requires attention to several "hurdles": The majority of pilgrimage churches combine other functions as well, such as cathedrals (Cologne), collegiate monasteries (Aachen) or abbeys (Weingarten). In some cases the pilgrimages started later and may have influenced the form of a new building or reconstruction project, as in the case of Frederick Barbarossa’s translatio of the relics of the Three Kings to Cologne Cathedral in 1164. In other cases a miracle or the acquisition of relics launched the construction of a new church.

¹ Research on the different forms of female piety and monasticism has been the most fundamental contribution of feminist approaches to history and art history so far. Pioneering in this context is the work of Caroline Walker Bynum. It is not possible to give a thorough selection of Bynum’s studies in a footnote. See e. g. her seminal study: Caroline Walker Bynum, Jesus as Mother. Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages. (Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press, 1982). Her contributions had an important impact on numerous US art historians such as Jeffrey Hamburger (Jeffrey F. Hamburger, Nuns as artists: The Visual Culture of a Medieval Convent (Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press, 1997). For a summary of recent research see Caroline Walker Bynum, "Formen weiblicher Frömmigkeit im späteren Mittelalter," in Krone und Schleier: Kunst aus mittelalterlichen Frauenklöstern (München: Hirmer, 2005).

complex, as with the cult of St. Elizabeth of Thuringia in Marburg immediately after her death in 1231.

Another factor complicates a comprehensive survey. Whereas famous attractions such as Santiago and Rome were dominant in the early and high Middle Ages, the types of changes in devotion which start the 12th century led to many new forms of pilgrimage in the later Middle Ages, for example, those inspired by bleeding Hosts. Running parallel to this diversification of the objects and goals of pilgrimage, numerous regional & local centers now competed with the traditional pilgrimage sites, particularly beginning in the 14th century.

The regionally-diverse states of preservation further complicate the situation. Among the numerous medieval churches, most have largely lost their original character. In Catholic territories, most churches were either rebuilt and redecorated in the Baroque period or were destroyed and replaced by new buildings, such as the pilgrimage church for the Holy-Blood-Relic in the Benedictine Abbey Church of Weingarten. The starting point for research is more favorable in the Lutheran territories of northern Germany and Scandinavia. These regions did not participate in the iconoclasm of the peasant's war, the "Bauernkrieg," and thus tolerated the old furnishings. But there the liturgical tradition ended, so few written sources survive.

The Münster of Aachen, center of one of the most popular central European pilgrimages in the later Middle Ages, may serve as an introductory example to outline the problems and questions of present scholarship. The Heiltnumsfahrten to Aachen blossomed particularly since the 14th century, when Emperor Charles IV, who was an admirer of Charlemagne, promoted the veneration of his shrine and the relic treasury of the Münster. Since then every seven years a multitude of people have come to Aachen. (ill. 1) The Heiltnumsweisung itself took place outside the church from a balcony, where the treasury was shown to the public.

---


III. 1 Print showing the *Heiltumsfahrten* at Aachen
The pilgrimage was certainly not a phenomenon limited to the exterior of the church every seven years. But how did the architecture respond to the specific functional needs of the pilgrimage? A first look at the ground-plan of Aachen shows that the structure with the Carolingian Palatinate Chapel and the 14th century choir can be hardly characterized as pilgrimage architecture, providing an appropriate frame for the masses of pilgrims. Furthermore the late medieval Münster was not only the place of a collegiate monastery but – as we have already seen - the coronation church of the German kings.

Nonetheless in a charter of May 14th, 1355 the building of the new Gothic choir of Aachen Münster was justified with an account of a big crowd of pilgrims. But to what extent was the new architecture made for the pilgrims, since it does not correspond to our image of a pilgrimage church? Regarding the immense popularity of the Heiltumsfahrt and the specific function as coronation church we would expect a quick building process. However, the erection of the choir dragged on until 1414, the year of its dedication. Later on the Marienkapelle at the site of the old main apse was (completed in 1455). In Mary’s chapel there was the famous shrine, covered by painted wooden panels. Its situation on an elevated tribune facilitated the custom of the pilgrims walking through under the shrine. Furthermore this chapel, which was demolished in 1786, preserved the venerated image “Unserer Lieben Frau von Aachen.”

The other major shrine, the Karlschrein with the relics of Charlemagne, was placed east of the main altar. Similarly to the Marienschrein, it was also elevated and covered by painted wooden panels. There was some kind of an ambulatory behind the altar, which was slightly deeper than the rest of the choir, again enabling the visitor to pass under the reliquary shrine. Crowning the high altar, the shrine was easily visible from the other end of the choir. This complex arrangement makes clear that the access to both shrines must have been regulated in different ways. For the ordinary pilgrim it was certainly possible to come relatively close to the Marienschrein and to see at least its covering from the gratings. The entrance to the chapel itself was undoubtedly limited to certain groups of pilgrims. The shrine of Charlemagne at the eastern end was integrated into the pilgrim experience, at least visually. Nonetheless, the rudimentary ambulatory makes clear that even there, only certain groups of pilgrims, such as nobles, had access to the choir at specific times. In this context the text of the source of 1355 may be interpreted in a different way: Indeed the crowds of pilgrims stimulated the building project. However, the new building apparently was not intended to provide more space for the pilgrims, but for the clerics and their services in a clearly-separated part of the church.

Thus we can see that the relationship between liturgy and pilgrimage at Aachen needs further study. But this more-detailed research faces several obstacles: Although numerous medieval furnishings and the famous shrines survive, the context of their presentation has changed, making it difficult to reconstruct the original disposition. The interior topography of the church was especially altered in the second half of the 18th century. Furthermore, other important parts of the decoration, such as the stained glass, are completely lost. But medieval written sources have not been thoroughly analyzed yet, consequently, a comprehensive architectural

---


history of Aachen *Münster* in the context of its liturgy and function is still a task for future research.

Ill. 2 Marienkapelle at Aachen, 1455

This is a characteristic situation for many other churches, such as the famous *Elisabethkirche* in Marburg. There we have at first glance, an extraordinarily well-preserved interior with the choir screen, the grave of Saint Elisabeth, and the 13th century high altar still at their original places. The church, as well as the cult of Elisabeth, has attracted much scholarly attention. While art historians assumed for a long time that a popular saint in the later Middle Ages automatically resulted in equally-popular pilgrimage, this view has been contested in recent years. In the years following Elisabeth’s death and subsequent canonization of her burial place, the church attracted numerous pilgrims, causing Alberich of Troisfontaines (†1252) to compare Marburg with Santiago de Compostela. Yet, since the middle of the 13th century the pilgrimage to Elisabeth and its role for the church and convent apparently declined. Karl E. Demandt has collected the documents regarding the income of the convent, which show that during the 15th century, pilgrimage accounted for only a small portion of the proceeds. We have to take into account in this context that sudden popular mass pilgrimages, such as Wilsnack, are a later phenomenon, and did not start before the early fourteenth century. Instead, after c. 1250, the tradition of the German Order and St. Mary became the main patrons of the Marburg church, replacing St. Elisabeth. Furthermore, Elisabeth, wife of Landgraf Ludwig IV of Thuringia, became the patron saint of the whole state of Hessen, giving Marburg a more aristocratic character as pilgrimage attraction. Recent research has emphasized that the German Order, as keeper of the shrine, had interests which differed from the ideals of Elisabeth and that its political ambitions presumably moved away from the attention and care for the shrine to other areas such as the Christianization of the later *Deutschordensland* on the Baltic Sea. But still it is not clear whether the changes around c. 1250 were a strategic decision of the wealthy convent or that of an

---


10 Werner, "Die Heilige Elisabeth und die Anfänge des Deutschen Ordens in Marburg," 160 with note 257.


ordinary example of pilgrimage in the 13th century with clerics reacting to a declining attractiveness for pilgrims which had begun after the elevation of the body in 1235.

At this point it is necessary to look at the church with its architecture and furnishings more closely. For a church erected shortly after the death of Elisabeth we would expect the architecture to be perfectly adjusted to the necessities of a pilgrimage. Andreas Köstler noted in his 1995 dissertation on the Elisabethkirche that the triconch choir (ill. 3) was not optimally suited to handling of pilgrims, especially with the additional restrictions imposed by the liturgical choir which blocked access to the crossing with its choir screens.15

A look at the pilgrimage church of Wilsnack, one of the most popular pilgrimages of the later 15th century, reveals ground-plans and architecture that convey a confusing image of the pilgrimage church.16 (ill. 3) After a host miracle in 1383, the erection of the large church probably began during the late 14th century. In 1401, when Bishop Wöpelitz of Havelberg died, choir and transept were probably finished. One point is of particular interest here. The form of the nave was changed during this construction, which was completed not much later than 1430.17 Its length was reduced to join the nave with the stump of the tower of the older church. One motivation could have been to place the new building in the tradition of its predecessor. What is more significant for our argument is the fact that the builders took into account the reduced length of the nave, i.e. that one bay more or less was apparently not a concern for them. This could mean that the essential parts of the mass pilgrimage took place outside or around the shrine and it was not notably restricted by the shorter nave. Furthermore, we have seen in Aachen that ground-plans and regulations do not determine the success or failure of a pilgrimage.

For Marburg, Köstler notes the increasingly-strict regulations that blocked access to the church and to the relics of the saint. The shrine of Elisabeth was originally elevated behind the high altar to be seen at least from the nave. (ill. 4) But this arrangement was changed probably before the completion the new high altar retable in the late 13th century.18 A substructure for the shrine, comparable to those of Aachen and St. Ursula of Cologne,19 was abandoned and the reliquary was moved to the sacristy at the north side of the choir behind an iron grating where it still resides today. (ill. 5)


17 Claudia Lichte, Die Inszenierung einer Wallfahrt: der Lettner im Havelberger Dom und das Wilsnacker Wunderblut (Worms: Werner, 1990), 34.


19 On St. Ursula, see, most recently, Anton Legner, Köln er Heilige und Heiligtümer: Ein Jahrtausend europäischer Reliquienkultur (Köln: Greven, 2002), 208.
Ill. 3 Groundplan of Elisabethkirche, Marburg

Ill. 5 Interior, north side of the choir, Marburg Cathedral.

Picture Source: Gerhard Lutz.
This new placement was completed at a time when the pilgrimage already had lost its attractiveness to the broader public. Köstler characterizes this gradual retreat of the shrine as a process of *Hermetisierung* [hermeticization] based on a lack of interest by the German Order in promoting the pilgrimage.\(^{20}\) As we have seen, it is not clear yet in the context of 13\(^{th}\) century pilgrimage whether the decline of the pilgrimage and the changes in the presentation of the shrine were based on a specific strategy of the German Order. In the course of the increasing importance of Elisabeth for the German nobility and the *Landgrafen* of Hessen as patron of their state, the presentation in a separate treasury room may have been a reaction to an on-going change of the target audience. The original plans for the presentation of the shrine behind the late 13\(^{th}\) century high altarpiece show that the clerics initially wanted to present the relics in a manner similar to that of other contemporary pilgrimage sites.\(^{21}\) The different arrangement in the sacristy then gave the access to the shrine a more intimate character which would have been an ideal form to attract aristocratic pilgrims. All these conclusions remain speculative because we do not have any contemporary written sources about the liturgical practice in the *Elisabethkirche* before the early 15\(^{th}\) century.\(^{22}\) Our understanding of the pilgrimage site will remain fragmentary without a more detailed image of the position of the main reliquary shrine within the liturgy of the church and unless we know to what extent this shrine was moved and presented in processions and presentations to the public.

The main problem is that we have no broader context of research at the moment; no system of regulations for seeing and accessing the shrine that was characteristic for late medieval pilgrimages. Most of the surviving sites do not fulfill our image of an ideal pilgrimage church. One of the few exceptions is the building of Cologne Cathedral after 1248, where the shrine of the Three Wise Men was destined to be placed prominently in the crossing.\(^{23}\) But after a slowdown of the building process, the shrine was placed in the axial chapel of the ambulatory on the occasion of the dedication of the choir in 1322 – acting as an interim or even long-term solution.\(^{24}\)

The studies presented in this volume of *Peregrinations* introduces further examples of research in this field with surprising results which complement the observations on Aachen and

---

\(^{20}\) He even describes Elisabeth’s hospital and the pilgrimage as “unwelcome remains” (*unerwünschte Reste*) in the eyes of the German Order. Köstler, *Die Ausstattung der Marburger Elisabethkirche: Zur Ästhetisierung des Kultraums im Mittelalter*, 61. *Hermetisierung* and *Ästhetisierung* of the church interior are central terms of Köstler’s study. He draws numerous interesting conclusions that should be discussed in a more detailed way. However, some of his assumptions are problematic as he transfers the conclusions by Demandt and Werner too strictly into an art-historical study, dominating his interpretation of the changes of the interior structure of the church as an overall strategy of the clerics and their order. E. g. he interprets the triconch choir and the placing of the tomb of Elisabeth in the northern apse as a process of pushing away (*Abdrängung*) of the shrine within the church interior. See Köstler, *Die Ausstattung der Marburger Elisabethkirche: Zur Ästhetisierung des Kultraums im Mittelalter*, 61.


\(^{24}\) Lauer, "Bildprogramme des Kölner Domchores vom 13. bis zum 16. Jahrhundert," 204
Marburg. But further case studies are necessary in order to come to more general conclusions and to give a new perspective for studies on late medieval pilgrimage architecture.

Bibliography:


Heinrich Schiffers, Karls des Großen Reliquienschatz und die Anfänge der Aachenfahrt, Veröffentlichungen d. Bischöflichen Diözesanarchivs Aachen, 10 (Aachen: Volk, 1951).


The Pilgrimage Church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port and its Late Medieval Furnishings
by Andreas Förderer

Introduction

In his recent study on south German parish churches, Klaus Jan Philipp emphasized that there is no function-specific typology in the religious architecture of the Middle Ages: “Observing the structure only, it is simply impossible for us to tell, without further information, if it is an episcopal church, collegiate church, monastery church, parish church or a chapel […]”.\(^\text{25}\) This observation is confirmed by the comparison of numerous ground plans in the seminal study Die kirchliche Baukunst des Abendlandes [The Religious Architecture of the Western World] by Georg Dehio and Gustav Bezold,\(^\text{26}\) where plans of cathedrals were compared with churches serving completely different functions. To emphasize the point, these plans were presented without any indications of furnishings in order to avoid distracting the reader from the focus of the plan. Although construction and renovation projects of churches were certainly the result of needs and specific ideas, it is sometimes difficult to ascertain an obvious relationship between form and function. Nevertheless numerous recent studies on such relationships between form and function at medieval churches have shown promise, because they approach the architecture as a complex answer to very specific standards and conditions, rather than a mindless following of general rules.\(^\text{27}\)


\(^{26}\) Georg Dehio/Gustav von Bezold, Die kirchliche Baukunst des Abendlandes (Stuttgart 1892-1901).

\(^{27}\) Artistic integration in Gothic Buildings; Rev. Papers presented at the conference [...] held at York University, Toronto, on Apr. 7-9, 1989 (Toronto/Buffalo/London 1995)
Figure 1  Church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port (France, Dep. Meurthe-et-Moselle). Photo: Author.
On this basis the following paper will explore the conception of religious architecture at the end of the fifteenth century, using the pilgrimage church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port (France, Dep. Meurthe-et-Moselle) (fig. 1) as a case study. This church is an excellent example of how the form of the church reflected its use as a pilgrimage center. Its earlier church building was completely replaced between 1475 and 1520 and its use was not overlaid with other functions such as was often the case with cathedrals.

The Location, the Pilgrimage and the Construction of the Church

The beginnings of the pilgrimage in Saint-Nicolas-de-Port are unclear. The dedication of a church with St. Nicholas as patron was recorded in 1101. This event was probably related to the arrival of St. Nicholas’ finger relic, following the arrival of the saint’s relics in Bari in 1087. Unfortunately there is no further information regarding the cult’s earlier constructions here. However, several documents reflect how attractive the site was to pilgrims in the later Middle Ages.28 A biographer of the later sanctified French king Louis IX (1214-70) reported that the king and his wife were rescued on their return from the crusade after someone called out to Nicholas of Lorraine in distress during a sea storm, promising the saint a silver ship in return for their safety. Furthermore several pilgrimage badges of the 13th century from Saint-Nicolas-de-Port testify to the popularity of the pilgrimage in northern Europe. Finally, in 1471 King René d’Anjou and his wife donated a golden arm reliquary adorned with precious stones.

Plans to build a new church in Saint-Nicolas-de-Port began to take shape around 1470. This design included three aisles in the form of basilica with a two-tower façade to the west. The eastern parts consisted of a Benedictine choir with three apses and a transept, which do not widen than the structure beyond the aisles (fig. 2). Unfortunately, only vague information on possible commissioners and financial resources of the construction survives. In the 15th century, Saint-Nicolas-de-Port was larger than Nancy, the neighboring residence of the Duke of Lorraine. The city enjoyed remarkable growth during this period as houses were built around two symbiotically interdependent centers -- the pilgrimage church and the market.

Figure 2  Plan of the Church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port (France, Dep. Meurthe-et-Moselle). Photo: Author.
Only this combination of pilgrimage and trade could have facilitated the construction of the church in its ultimate, fully expanded, dimensions.

Questions regarding the reasons behind the design of the church, require an analysis of how the builders attempted to make optimal use of the available site. Two main streets along the city’s slope (which had been built in the context of rapid urban development) led to a noticeable bend in the longitudinal axis of the church building. (fig. 3) Two portals were placed at the transept responding to the arterial route of the city, passing through the choir of the church, to offer a short-cut entrance. (fig. 4) The transept, which is only visible in the elevation, was a further compromise between the limitations of tradition and the specific topographic situation. (fig. 5) The complete demolition of the pre-existing structure indicates that expansion of the space was probably the central motivation for constructing a completely new building.

Yet, the church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port does not reflect its function as a pilgrimage church by its large dimensions. Nor does it have an ambulatory, which is characteristic for numerous pilgrimage churches. Instead the church, in its general demeanor, actually passes itself off as a cathedral, (fig. 6) but at the end of the 15th century Saint-Nicolas was only an emergent priory of the Benedictine abbey Gorze. Therefore the architectural promotion of the pilgrimage, spurred by a competition with the major religious centers of Lorraine (Metz, Toul and Verdun), was certainly desirable and intended outcome.

**Reconstruction of the Furnishings Contemporary with the Period of Building**

Reconstructing the remnants of the original furnishings enables us to clarify the relationship between the form and the use of the building. Vincenzo Scamozzi made a stop in Saint-Nicolas-de-Port in 1600 on his way from Paris to Venice and sketched the ground plan of the church in his diary. (fig. 7) The situation depicted by Scamozzi in 1600 probably corresponds to that of the period of the completion of the church between 1510 and 1520. The drawing shows the altar with the relic of Saint Nicolas as the center of the pilgrimage church at the crossing of transept and nave.29 Instead of the present situation of an uninterrupted

Figure 3 Plan of immediate vicinity. (France, Dep. Meurthe-et-Moselle, Nancy: 2MI art. 454. Photo: Public domain image.)
Figure 5 Church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port, from the south (France, Dep. Meurthe-et-Moselle).
Photo: Author.

Figure 6 Interior, nave looking towards the east, Church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port (France, Dep. Meurthe-et-Moselle).
Photo: Author.
Figure 7 Sketch of Church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port by Vincenzo Scamozzi, 1600 (west façade, plan, and elevation. Photo: After Franco Barbieri (ed.), Vincenzo Scamozzi: Taccuino di viaggio da Parigi a Venezia (Venezia/Roma 1959).
central nave from the main portal in the west to the baroque altar in the central apse we must envision it as a multi-divided room. The central nave was separated from the transept by the reliquary altar. (Components of this original altar are preserved in a chapel in the church.) (fig. 9) Furthermore, during the main construction period, a treasure chamber was integrated along the outer wall of the transept in close proximity to the central nave. (fig. 8)

The use of the church can be outlined on this basis: the medieval pilgrim entered the church mainly through the transept portals. After entering the church, the pilgrim would have found himself at the western end of the nave, between the central choir in the east which was reserved for the clerics and the backside of the reliquary altar. Then the pilgrim would have walked through the side aisles into the nave, which was entirely aligned with the reliquary altar. As this area was independent from those reserved for the religious services and times of prayer of the clerics, the pilgrim could have entered the nave at any time. The reliquary altar consisted of a mensa and a gate, which was placed between the pillars of the central nave. This screen had two openings and was decorated in the middle with a still-preserved, stone turret, inside of which the arm reliquary with the relic of St. Nicholas could have been placed. (fig. 10) In this upper part the relic, while still protected, remained visible.

The reliquary was brought into the adjacent treasure chamber during the night. This two-story construction remains intact in the western bay of the northern end of the transept. (fig. 11) At the ground level, two cabinets were built into the wall to store the church’s treasure. The door to this room was secured with the aid of an iron rod, which was inserted and locked into the ground in front of the door. The iron rod could only be removed and brought into the room above the treasure chamber. A narrow staircase led to this room, which, because of its alcove, probably served as the guard’s room or watching chamber. There are two windows in it: one offering a view to the street and another into the church.

**An Interpretation**

The large dimensions of the later Saint-Nicolas-de-Port church, defined by the topographical situation, harmonized with its use. A distinction between both main functions “pilgrimage” and “choir reserved for the clerics” was reached by the ground plan and the well thought-out positioning of the furnishings. This made it possible to perform a liturgy according to the demands of the pilgrims, such as that seen later in baroque pilgrimage.
Figure 8  Treasure Chamber of the Church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port (France, Dep. Meurthe-et-Moselle).
Photo: Author.

Figure 9  Secondary Components of the Original Reliquary Altar, Church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port (France, Dep. Meurthe-et-Moselle).
Photo: Author.
Figure 10 Stone Turret of the Original Reliquary Altar, Church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port (France, Dep. Meurthe-et-Moselle). Photo: Author.

Figure 11 Plan and Elevation of the Two-Story Treasure Chamber in the Church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port (France, Dep. Meurthe-et-Moselle). Photo: After Odile Kammer-Schweyer, La Lorraine des marchands à Saint-Nicolas-de-Port (du 14e au 16e siècle) (tome 26 du recueil de documents sur l’histoire de Lorraine), Saint-Nicolas-de-Port 1985.
churches like Vierzehnheiligen (Bavaria). It should be pointed out that the placement of the choir of the pre-existing church had most likely been in the area of the later reliquary altar. One reason for the afore-mentioned division of the new structure could have been the wish to maintain a site strongly connected with the relic because the effects of the relic in this location were of great importance. Whether this arrangement was determined by these conditions, clearly intended or not, the isolation of the reliquary altar accentuated the position of the reliquary in the center of the church and facilitated a liturgy focused around the relic and its significance for pilgrims.

A written source survives, which is very likely connected to the completion of the newer church, or to the beginning of its use. Duke Antoine of Lorraine founded a Mass for the church in 1511: “...pour la singuliere et fervante devotion que nous avons au glorieux corps saint confesseur et amy de Dieu, monsieur sainct Nicolas, notre bon advocat et patron ayons presentement fonde et institue une messe cothidiane estre dite et celebree perpetuellement a l’autel de ly maistre mons. Saint Nicolas [...] laquelle messe nous voulons et entendons estre dite et celebré vers les onze et douze heures du matin quelle soit achevee et finie environ le midi et non plus longue affin que les pellerins qui arriveront tard aud. St Nicolas ou autres gens qui navroient este du matin a l’église puissent ouyr lad messe et pour a icelle convocuer et appeller le peuple y soit sonne de la plus grande cloche de ladite eglise [seize?] coups affin attract et distinct l’un apres l’autre non pas a branlle mais d’un coste de ladite cloche seulement ...”30. The duke sponsored this daily Mass at the reliquary altar, to be said between 11 and 12 a.m. enabling late-arriving pilgrims to attend the service. The Mass was announced by separate bell chimes.

The creation of architectural and liturgical premises for permanent pilgrimages independent from those associated with holidays reflects, in my view, that in St.-Nicolas-de-Port the specific standards of pilgrimage were strongly connected with trade. Yet one might also suspect a change in religious needs or desires. Alain Erlande-Brandenburg recently pointed out that phenomena such as rood screens, which allowed a full view of the choir beyond, like that in Saint-Madeleine in Troyes, should be interpreted as examples of the desire of the laypeople for immediate participation in the liturgy.31 An inaccessible relic, which is only visible on certain days of the

30 Archives Départementales de Meurthe et Moselle, Nancy: 2MI art. 454, B 12, f° 83 v°-84 v°.

year such as that of the Cuthbert shrine in Durham Cathedral\textsuperscript{32}, would have been certainly detrimental for both the pilgrimage and the local trade.

**Conclusion**

The interpretation of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port and its furnishings shows the current paucity of in-depth investigations regarding the customs and development of this particular medieval pilgrimage. What kind of pilgrimages were there? How many of the pilgrims regarded the pilgrimage shrine as the ultimate destination? How many travelers regarded the pilgrimage site only as a welcome stop on a major route? Which local and liturgical conditions guaranteed the “success” of a pilgrimage, when we take into consideration that the miracle remained the exception at any rate? Regarding the immense size of the church and its pronounced “user-friendly” furnishings, we may draw a comparison to our contemporary “event culture,” revealing a new interpretation. The new church was not only an adjustment of the architectural space to the changed needs of the pilgrimage, but was an object of economic speculation; with hopes of increasing the number of visitors to the new attraction, and thereby secure the flow and productivity of trade. On this basis, donations given by the citizens for the construction of the church were religious as well as business investments, as they hoped the pilgrims would increase their future profits.

The choice of a cathedral plan as the ideal type of structure for Saint-Nicolas-de-Port does not reflect functional considerations in my view. The style instead communicated the legitimizing power of tradition to the visitors, while appearing to guarantee the overall acceptance of the new building. Sadly, as Odile Kammerer-Schweyer noted, these hopes were never borne out. A decline in the Saint-Nicolas-de-Port’s economy began within a few decades after the completion of the church, just before 1635, when the Thirty Years’ War finally devastated the area.\textsuperscript{33} After


\textsuperscript{33} Odile Kammerer-Schweyer, *La Lorraine des marchands à Saint-Nicolas-de-Port (du 14\textsuperscript{e} au 16\textsuperscript{e} siècle);* tome 26 du recueil de documents sur l’histoire de Lorraine (Saint-Nicolas-de-Port, 1985).
all, mass phenomena, at the beginning of the 16th century as in our days, are only partially controlled.

**Bibliography**

*Artistic Integration 1995 - *Artistic integration in Gothic buildings* (= Rev. Papers presented at the conference [...] held at York University, Toronto, on Apr. 7-9, 1989),


Pilgrimage in the Medieval City. The Example of Nuremberg in the 15th Century

By Gerhard Weilandt

Research on the architecture of pilgrimage usually focuses on those buildings that owe their importance directly to their roles as centers of pilgrimage, like the churches of Vézelay or Santiago de Compostela. One easily forgets the numerous other churches which served as destinations for pilgrims as well; churches that were built for other purposes and for which pilgrimage was only a secondary – nevertheless important – purpose. This essay examines the medieval city of Nuremberg as an example of this, where a rich corpus of written documentation allows certain qualified statements.

Almost every church in Nuremberg owned a rich treasure of relics that were regularly exhibited to attract pilgrims. The relics of the Holy Empire must be mentioned first. They were kept in Nuremberg since 1425 in the Church of the Hospital of the Holy Ghost. In their first years there, they were exposed inside the church, but soon the church building proved to be too small for the pilgrim crowds, so that the display was moved to the nearby market place (der Hauptmarkt), where they were shown from the balcony of a private building for veneration. (fig. 1) The Masses celebrated here were solemnly approved by the bishop of Bamberg in 1433 (necessary because the exhibition place was not a consecrated church.) The day of the exposition, die Heiltumsweisung, was a general feast in Nuremberg and its popularity caused such a great crush of people, that the city council took precautionary measures to prevent a revolt. During the rest of the year, the shrine with the relics was hung on an iron chain high up in the choir of the Church of the Holy Ghost. (fig. 2)

---

34 Stadtarchiv Nürnberg, Urkundenreihe 1433, April 24.

35 Stadtarchiv Nürnberg, D 2/III, Rechnungen Nr. 209, 1663, ad Febr. 10: “Item Hannßen Christoph Götz Mahlern alhier von einer großen Ketten, doran der Casten zum Heilthumb hengt zuvergulden: 10 fl.”
Fig. 2: Nuremberg, HI. *Geist-Spital*, engraving by Johann Andreas Graff, 1696; Archive of the author.
But at some minor feasts, the relics were presented to the public within the church itself, as attested to by the 1460 indulgence of the bishop of Eichstätt who referred to the church “where the imperial relics of the passion of Christ are kept,”\(^{36}\) being open on certain days to all visitors. Except for these days, only distinguished guests such as princes were allowed to gaze at the relics of the Holy Empire – each time with the formal approval of the city authorities. For that purpose the shrine was let down on the chain, then opened so the relics could be venerated. Immediately after the visit it had to be pulled up again in order to avoid the possibility of the holy remains being stolen. The choir of the church of the Holy Ghost had been built in the 14\(^{th}\) century, long before the imperial treasure was brought to Nuremberg. Nevertheless it was well-suited for keeping such a shrine. The building itself acted as a monumental shrine similar to the Ste. Chapelle in Paris or the late Gothic choir of the imperial church in Aachen. The main difference was that, in Nuremberg, the treasure was suspended in the airy heights, placing it even more precisely in the center of the architecture. The relics of the Holy Empire, including the imperial crown and the holy lance, were the most important treasures not only of Nuremberg but also in all of Germany.

But there were more, incredibly important, relics in the other Nuremberg churches. The Dominicans kept the relics of the Holy Innocents, the children killed by King Herod in his attempt to find the Christ child. These relics were presented to the public in a shrine made of glass,\(^{37}\) which was placed in a chapel attached to the nave, rather than in the choir, where the pilgrims would disturb the monks during their prayer. A statue of the Virgin Mary which stood in the now-destroyed Franciscan church was another important object of veneration. It was also placed outside of the choir in the nave and was solemnly consecrated by a bishop in 1434.\(^{38}\)

\(^{36}\) Stadtarchiv Nürnberg, Urkundenreihe 1460, März 14: in qua … reliquie de passionibus Cristi imperiales nuncupate conservantur.


\(^{38}\) Wilhelm Deinhardt, Dedicationes Bambergenses. Weihenotizen und -urkunden aus dem mittelalterlichen Bistum Bamberg (Beiträge zur Kirchengeschichte Deutschlands 1), Freiburg/Br. 1936, p. 76, No. 112: “…Item eadem prescripta dominica [1434, June 20] in eadem ecclesia prenominata benediximus et consecrauimus ymagine beate virginis Marie apponendo multas reliquias sanctorum, ut quicunque Chrisi fidelium coram predicta ymagine deuote flexis genibus dixerint angelicam salutacionem seu Aue Maria trina
this is the only surviving dedication document of a sculpture in Nuremberg underlines its importance. The statue owed its veneration less to its artistic value than to the fact that numerous relics were placed within its body. Every person kneeling in front of it and reciting the Ave Maria obtained an indulgence. Another church, the Chapel of the Virgin Mary (die Frauenkirche) at the main market possessed relics of the girdle and veil of the Virgin Mary, which were enclosed in precious reliquaries and exhibited from time to time.39

Even the Chapel of the Hospice of St. Martha could brag of important relics and reliquaries. There, the pilgrims rested in a common room, with the more distinguished, die ehrbaren, but slightly separated from the others, and, of course, the men were strictly separated from the women. To garner publicity and attract as many pilgrims as possible, every high feast was announced from the pulpits of the main churches in the city and leaflets were attached to church portals. The text of one, for the feast of St. Matthias, has come down to us: “On the next day N. is the day of the holy apostle St. Mathias that will be celebrated laudably at the chapel of St. Martha. And the day before they will sing vespers and preach afterwards. And on the day itself they will sing and celebrate the Mass and there you will find great mercy and indulgence.” (Auff den nachsten N. ist der tag des heyligen zwelfpoten sand Mathias, den wirt man lobelichen begen zw sand Martha und am abent wirt man da vesper singen und darnach predigen, und am tag meß singen und lesen da vindt ir groß gnad und applaß).40 The day before the feast, the sacristan opened the altarpieces and decorated the altar of the day (for example, the altar of St. Matthias on his day) with a carpet and vexilla. He spread grass and placed trees as embellishments in the church and lit numerous candles. The relics were exposed on the altars and on the Heiltumsstuhl

---


40 Stadtarchiv Nürnberg, D 15, M IV, No. 9 (Stiftungsbuch des Marthaspitals, 1471), fol. 12v.
—a relic stand used to collect the alms (daß man das almußen dapey sammeln sol),\textsuperscript{41} that was covered with cushions upon which the sacristan placed the skulls, jaws, and other bones, preserved in shrines and monstrances. The relic stand was flanked by four gilt sculptures of angels, amplifying the effect of the decoration. An honorable man took care of the treasures, a service for which he received a bottle of wine. The sacristan was rewarded for his trouble, too, and the more money collected in alms on the relic stand, the more money he received. The presentation of relics took place in a comparable way in the other churches of the city.

The importance of the financial aspect so strongly emphasized in the documents, is echoed by another example. From the parish Church of St. Lorenz we know that income from every feast in the ecclesiastical year over several decades was recorded in the Almosenbuch – alms book.\textsuperscript{42} This archive refers to the voluntary gifts of the pilgrims visiting the church (mostly on feast days), when the relics were presented on the relic stands and altars. From 1439 to 1472, a huge new choir hall of St. Lorenz was erected. (fig. 3) Fortunately, documents from some years survive which record the expenses of building the choir and these can be compared to the income from the alms. I have published these accounts elsewhere in detail, but here, briefly, is the result: In the four years where we can compare the expenses with the income the voluntary alms of the pilgrims covered between 31.3 and 37.6 % of the entire cost of construction. In other words: one third of the expenses for the choir could be met by the alms of the pilgrims. These documents allow one to understand the considerable importance of the pilgrimage in this Nuremberg parish church.

\textsuperscript{41} Stadtarchiv Nürnberg, D 15, M IV, No. 9, fol. 13r: “Item am abent [the day before the feast] sol der meßner die kirchen zieren und die altar auff thün und den altar zieren, dar auf sand Mathias rast, und das er ein tebich hencke über den selben altar und ein pancklach slahe auff die seyten deß selben altars, auch das er den heylthum stul zw richt daß man das almußen dapey sammeln sol der pfleger befelhen das der meßner ein erbern man pit, der deß abentz und am tag piß daß man die meß gesingt pey dem heyltum sitze, darumb sol ym der pfleger geben ein maß weins zuvertrincken.”

Fig. 3: Nuremberg, St. Lorenz. Stadtarchiv.
The Church St. Sebaldus and the Church of the Nunnery of St. Katharina

The crucial importance of pilgrimage is also evident in two other Nuremberg churches: the main Nuremberg Church of St. Sebald and the Church of the Dominican nunnery of St. Katharina. Both are fascinating examples because they differ markedly from one another both in function and in their architectural structure. St. Sebald, the oldest parish church, was open to everyone, while St. Katharina, as a convent church, very strictly obliged its members to keep away from the outer world. One wonders how the pilgrimage took place in both churches and how the pilgrimage affected their architecture.

St. Sebald is a Romanesque basilica with two choirs; the eastern one being replaced by a Gothic choir during the years 1361 to 1379.\(^{43}\) (fig. 4) In constructing the new choir, workmen erected its enclosing walls leaving the old Romanesque building untouched. The citizens of Nuremberg wanted to keep the old church functioning as long as possible. It was not until 1374 – eleven years after the commencement of construction – that the bishop of Bamberg allowed them to pull down the old choir.

The decision to erect the new choir with an ambulatory was closely connected with the growing cult of St. Sebald, a hermit, who was buried in the church – and is still buried there today. Already in the 13\(^{\text{th}}\) century the parish church was named after this saint, even though he would not be officially canonized until the 15\(^{\text{th}}\) century. The high altar was dedicated to another patron, St. Peter, and in 1337, St. Sebald is first mentioned as secondary patron of the high altar. Some years later, c.1340/50, a stone sculpture, placed prominently in the church, represented him for the first time. In 1379, on the occasion of the dedication of the choir and the new high altar, he became the main patron. This shows how the building of the choir and the cult of St. Sebald were closely connected. The driving force behind the propaganda of St. Sebald was the city council of Nuremberg. This is verified by the fact that on the initiative and monies of the council, the legend of St. Sebald (\textit{hystorie von sand Sebolde}) was copied and sent to all monasteries in the city, so they could celebrate his feast every year with singing like that in the parish church. The saint was the patron of the whole city and the new hall choir became his encompassing shrine, with the saint himself placed in the center of the choir. In 1397, a new silver shrine was

Fig. 4: Nuremberg, St. Sebald, hall choir, pre-war photo; Archive of the author.
commissioned, which is still preserved today. It was placed in the central axis, in the bay between the piers north IV/V and south IV/V (fig. 5, 6); after World War II it was moved one bay to the east. Its original placement meant that the parish clerics had their patron close to them while reading the hours -- he was literally among them.

Over time, a tense situation emerged: on the one hand the choir was the place where the clergy read and prayed and where distinguished guests like the emperor were solemnly received. On the other hand, the shrine of St. Sebald in the choir served as a destination of pilgrimage. So the clergy had to come to an arrangement with the needs of the public. During the time of the old Romanesque choir, the problem was not as grave since there were only a few parish priests. For the daily Masses which took place at the high altar, the attendance of the public was not only allowed, but was promoted. That is attested to by a 1303 document of the bishop of Bamberg, who promised an indulgence to everyone who “takes part in the celebration of the Mass in the choir of the Church of St. Sebald” on the main feasts of the ecclesiastical year, i.e. the feast of Our Lord, the Virgin Mary, and the Apostles.

The situation changed in the course of the 14th century, when many prebends were founded. The growing number of clerics meant that the public was increasingly considered as disturbance and was thus driven from the inner choir. With the completion of the Gothic hall choir in 1379 no further indulgences were granted to the visitors for attendance at the Masses. The older privileges were transmitted to another altar placed in the ambulatory, the altar of St. Peter, who had ceased to be the patron for the high altar. (fig. 6) Now, the visitors would normally gather in the ambulatory, not in the inner choir. The tabernacle was not situated close to the high altar, but was moved to the ambulatory, (fig. 6, Wn II) so that the priests of the minor altars and the venerators of the Holy Sacrament would no longer enter the sanctuary. We observe an increasing separation of the inner choir and the ambulatory, always with the intention to separate the clerics from the hustle and bustle of the world.

How did this intention affect the architecture? Looking at the hall choir in its present state, the inner choir appears to be completely open. The slender piers leave enough space between them to seemingly invite the visitor to stroll about, but the situation was completely different in the Middle Ages. There were numerous mobile furnishings that provided the structure and affected the original appearance of the architecture. These wooden objects have vanished almost entirely,
but they can be reconstructed. Stalls were inserted in the empty spaces between almost all
Fig. 5: Nuremberg, St Sebaldf’s shrine in the hall choir, photo c. 1900; by permission of Nuremberg Stadtarchiv.
Fig. 6: Nuremberg, St. Sebald, plan of the choir; Archive of the author.
piers, a situation that was preserved until World War II. (fig. 4, 5) There was a single opening for passage right in front of the high altar. (fig. 6 between the piers Pn II/III and Ps II/III) The stalls served not only seating purposes; they simultaneously separated the ambulatory simultaneously from the inner choir. The double seats were arranged back to back so that they could be used by the clerics during the liturgical hours as well as by the visitors to the ambulatory. However, they were not high enough to prevent the pilgrims in the ambulatory from looking into the inner choir, because their dossals were missing. An 1838 drawing by Georg Christoph Wilder illustrates the stalls in their original medieval state. (fig. 7), showing that, the pilgrims could normally see the shrine of St. Sebald, at least from a distance.

Further barriers completed the original disposition. Above the stalls between the western piers (fig. 6, Pn/s V-III) there were massive beams or *Tremen*, with wooden sculptures of angels on them. The angels served as removable candlesticks and were put up and lit, especially on high feasts. This disposition – angels on beams and double-sided stalls with a passage in front of the high altar – was copied in the second Nuremberg parish church of St. Lorenz in the 15th century, where, unlike St. Sebald, it has been preserved up to the present day. (figs. 4, 8). On several high feasts, sumptuous tapestries were suspended from the beams in St. Sebald. Out of at least five of such decorative series, only a single one survived: showing the legend of St. Sebald. (fig. 9) The tapestries served to decorate the inner choir on high feasts and to prevent curious glances.

The series of beams continued in north-south direction at the western end of the choir (piers Pn/s V). There was a crucifixion group with the Virgin Mary and St. John on this *Tram* lit by six candles. Underneath the vault of sacristy, another tapestry with the representation of the fourteen auxiliary saints (Holy Helpers) occasionally hung. They were intended to remind the visitors in the nave that St. Sebald could help them in their needs, too. He was regarded as particularly helpful for women when bearing their children. The western part of the inner choir was closed in the shape of a horseshoe: at the top, the beams featured sculptures and tapestries were hung below. On the floor, the gap between the western piers (n/s V) was closed by three altars which stood one beside the other. (fig. 6) With the completion of the Gothic choir, they marked the border to the old Romanesque nave, and between them only two relatively narrow gaps remained. They cannot have served as the main entrance to the high altar which was situated between the piers north and south.
Fig. 7: Georg Christoph Wilder, *Interior of St. Sebal's Church*, drawing, 1838; by permission of Nuremberg, Stadtarchiv.
Fig. 8: Nuremberg, St. Lorenz, angels on beams in the choir, c.1500; Archive of the author.

Fig. 9: Nuremberg, Germanisches Nationalmuseum, Tapestry with the Legend of St. Sebald, detail; with permission.
II/III. The purpose of all these obstacles placed between public ambulatory and inner choir was clearly to prevent disturbance of the priests during prayers. Such measures were not only useful, but necessary, as evidenced by a donation by the Nuremberg citizen Sigemund Oertel in 1496, who arranged to have a sum of four guilders given every year to keep the dogs out of the church in perpetuity. But it was the numerous pilgrims, whom these structures tried to prevent from stepping into the choir, at least during the liturgical hours.

Yet, it was not possible to keep them out completely since the shrine of St. Sebald was placed in the inner choir. The pilgrimage reached its annual culmination on his feast day of August 19. To prepare, the day before, the shrine and its covering box would be dusted and a canopy was placed above them. Then the administrator of the church, the Kirchenmeister, covered the shrine with thick roses made of pasteboard that symbolized the fragrance of paradise emanating from the relics of saints, in full view their medieval visitors. The following day, the shrine was carried in procession through the city of Nuremberg. Relic stands were erected outside the choir in the nave to collect money with armed persons stationed nearby to prevent theft. It seems that the head of St. Sebald and his arm were exhibited here since they were kept in their own reliquaries outside the shrine. Probably the other relic treasures of the church were also presented on the stands to attract as many pilgrims as possible. In any case, these stands were erected to relieve the choir (with the shrine) from the pilgrim masses and to prevent overcrowding.

The liturgical feasts and prayers performed in the inner choir and St. Sebald’s shrine were accessible to everyone. Big votive images made of wax hung from iron chains close to the shrine. There was also a stone suspended near the shrine as obvious proof of the saint’s power. According to legend, a peasant woman was sent to St. Sebald to bring him a big cheese as a pious gift. But, driven by stinginess, she exchanged the cheese for a smaller one. And as she laid it down at St. Sebald’s tomb, it was changed into a stone. Thus it was placed near his tomb to remind people of the legend. This story is depicted on the tapestry of St. Sebald from about 1425. (fig. 9) Despite the question of whether this story tells the truth or not, it does reveal that the shrine of St. Sebald was open to the public.

The pious alms of the pilgrims are an excellent indicator of the popular reputation of a saint. They consisted not only of wax votives or of natural products such as the famous cheese, but also of money. A look at the income of the church clearly shows the importance of the pilgrimage on
the feast of St. Sebald. For example, in the year 1499-1500, it amounted to 534 Nuremberg pounds. From this total the sum of 168 pounds came in during the feast day of St. Sebald alone, that is, more than the one-fourth part of the entire yearly income was collected in one single day. This emphasized the overwhelming importance of the pilgrimage for the church.

The high altar, dedicated to St. Sebald since 1379, was also featured on the feast day, though it played a minor role. According to the 15th-century liturgical handbook (*Mesnerpflichtbuch*) the retable was not opened at this time and a good frontal was put on the altar only. The *mensal* (or altar table), where the reliquaries were placed, was decorated with a golden cloth. A week after St. Sebald’s feast, on the octave, the sacristan put the previously-mentioned reliquary head of St. Sebald on the *mensal*. On this day, the stream of the pilgrims passed the high altar. The pious people came through the transept portals and from there, went through the southern and northern ambulatories. They reached the high altar through the gaps between the piers in front of the altar (Pn/s II/III).

At the place where the pilgrims turned in towards the sanctuary we can observe several monuments closely connected with pilgrimage. On the northern outer wall, just opposite the entrance to the inner choir (Wn V), there was a 15th-century mural painting, (lost in WWII). (fig. 10) An old photograph shows a blank area in the center of the mural that served as background for a lost object, obviously a sculpture. The surrounding scenes depict the pilgrimage to a saint, obviously St. Sebald, the patron saint of the church and the high altar; so the lost sculpture must have represented him. At the side, in the foreground, three citizens (probably parents with their son) knelt, formerly looking up to the saint. The rest of the picture is filled with ill and wounded people on pilgrimage: A lame figure with a crook moves forward on a winding path, while two men with pilgrim badges on their hats stride along towards their destination. In the background, on the left side, a man with an amputated leg leaves the scene when a family comes to meet him. The mother carries a motionless child, possibly a wax votive for St. Sebald, who was, as stated, famous for his assistance of pregnant women. However, the depicted destination of the journey, a church with a wood frame building, does not look much like the church of St. Sebald at the time when the mural painting was executed c.1460/70. Only the western tower resembles the still-existing Romanesque construction. From this we can conclude that the Romanesque predecessor of the Gothic church was represented. The reliability of this reconstruction, of course, has to remain an open question, but the picture is thoroughly interesting as an attempt to recall a
Fig. 10: Nuremberg, *St. Sebald, mural painting*; Archive of the author.
lost building. It served to stress the long tradition of the cult of St. Sebald and his high reputation. The place was chosen very carefully: on approaching the shrine, the pilgrims had to pass the sculpture of the saint with the wall-painting, and sometimes, when there was a great crush, they even had to rest there awhile.

On the south side of the ambulatory, we find an indication for another pilgrimage that took place at a different date. Here the patrician Haller family commissioned one of the huge windows of the choir (Ws IV). It dates to around 1379, when the building was completed and the donation rights were handed over to the leading Nuremberg families. The panels of stained glass depict scenes which were, in most points, influenced by the nearby altar of St. Stephen and St. George. The legend of the patron St. George, for example, occupies an entire row of the window. (fig. 11) In the fifth row, however, (fig. 12) we can see the Massacre of the Innocents distributed over four panels – just as detailed and thus equally important as the legend of the patron St. Martin. What was the purpose of a scene from the life of Christ in this place? There is no connection with the nearby altar and its liturgical function. The answer can be found in the earliest inventory of the treasures of the church, written down in the middle of the 15th century where we find a reference in the list of precious reliquaries to “ein silbrein vergult monstrancz mit der kindlein arm,” a gilt silver monstrance with the arm of one of the children, i.e. one of the Innocents of the Bible who were killed by order of king Herod. The relic was one of the main treasures of the church and was presented on the high altar every year on the feast day of the Innocents, December 28. It was intended to attract numerous pilgrims to the church from far and near. The visitors of the relic would pass the story of the Innocents depicted in the window. The representation served as a kind of road sign since it marked the place where the pilgrims could enter the inner choir. Simultaneously, it instructed the pious people about the fate of the poor children while they were waiting for the access to the high altar in the sanctuary – a very meaningful disposition that evoked pity of the pious, and spurred their readiness to give alms.

The second example is the church of the Dominican nuns, that of St. Katharina. The building was erected at the end of the 13th century and dedicated in the year 1297.44 It was

Fig. 11: Nuremberg, St. Sebald, window of the Haller family, detail; Archive of the author.

Fig. 12: Nuremberg, St. Sebald, window of the Haller family, detail; Archive of the author.
totally destroyed in World War II except for the outer walls and is now preserved as a ruin. The church was a Gothic basilica with a single-nave choir. The choir of St. Katharina is relatively narrow compared with St. Sebald and so appears not to be very suitable for pilgrimage. (fig. 13) Yet, recent research shows that there was indeed a pilgrimage there. The main relic of the monastery came from St. Catherine, the patron saint of the convent and the church. It was kept – as in St. Sebald – in the eastern choir of the monastery church. Large portions of the original shrine (dating to the end of the 15th century) are preserved in a dismantled state. They are usually – and still in recent scholarship – regarded as the remains of an altarpiece, but our investigations within the context of the research project Fränkische Tafelmalerei at the Technische Universität Berlin revealed that they were originally placed at the northern outer wall of the choir next to the entrance to the sacristy. This makes it impossible that it served as an altarpiece. On one hand, it would be completely unusual for a single-nave choir in Nuremberg, if there was more than one altar, —the high altar. The altarpiece of the high altar of St. Katharina is preserved; the Landauerretabel, now in the Germanisches Nationalmuseum.45 (fig. 14) On the other hand, an altar place orientated to the north would be equally strange. So the dismantled pieces must have had a different arrangement—indeed they don’t look very much like an altarpiece.

Rainer Brandl reconstructed the original appearance though not quite correctly.46 (figs. 15, 16) The shrine was divided into three horizontal registers with the upper two panels depicting the legend of St. Catherine from the teaching of the saint by a hermit up to her martyrdom, which is spread over the whole of the middle register in three scenes. In the lowest register the donor Georg Fütterer (with his sons and his wife with her daughters) was represented. The latter panel is missing, as well as the middle one, which once depicted the funeral of St. Catherine. The middle register was movable. It was possible to move it down – not up as Brandl reconstructed. When this was opened, the interior of the shrine became visible, showing a group of carved figures: St. Catherine lying on her deathbed, while three


Fig. 13: Nuremberg, *St. Katharina, interior*, pre-war photo; Archive of the author.
Fig. 14: Nuremberg, Germanisches Nationalmuseum, *Altarpiece of Marx Landauer*, c. 1465; with permission.
Fig. 15: Nuremberg, *Tomb of St. Catherine*, reconstruction by Rainer Brandl, closed; after Rainer Brandl.
Fig. 16: Nuremberg, *Tomb of St. Catherine*, reconstruction by Rainer Brandl, opened; after Rainer Brandl.
angels are about to seize and carry her up to heaven. When the shrine was opened, the lower register with the donors and the painted funeral of St. Catherine was concealed, being superfluous since the carved group in the center (now visible) represented the same subject. Neither could the outer scenes of the martyrdom be seen in the open position. But they were obviously regarded as crucially important, because they told the prehistory of the death of St. Catherine in an immediate and vivid depiction. Therefore the passion scenes from the outer side were repeated on the inner side of the middle register. Figure 17 shows the only preserved panel of this series, now in Vienna, Kunsthistorisches Museum. Split off from the panel with the outer scenes of martyrdom, it depicts the miracle of the wheel in nearly the same way as on the outer side (fig. 18). So while we notice a transformation, as far as the scenes are concerned, it is done without any decisive change. Only the sculptures in the center reflected a substantial increase in imagery, and that was just the point. The figure of St. Catherine was hollowed out in the chest where relics were originally kept. They were the reason why the construction of the shrine was so sumptuous. Obviously the sculpture of St. Catherine was revealed on high feasts only, especially on her feast day, when considerable alms were given to the church, according to the income records of the monastery.

How did the pilgrimage to St. Catherine in the eastern choir fit within the everyday life of the nuns in the monastery? We saw that there was a certain separation of the clerics from the ordinary people even in the parish church of St. Sebald. The problem was much more serious in a nunnery. The monastery of St. Katharina had been reformed in the year 1428 by followers of the strictest observance. This meant a complete separation of the nuns from the outside world. They used only a small part of the church -- a wooden gallery in the west— which was reserved for their needs. (fig. 19) Originally there must have been an entrance from the church, but it had apparently been closed as a result of the reform. A new entrance to the nuns’ choir was broken through the northern wall of the church creating an entry directly from the cloister. The current portal with the pointed arch was certainly installed later since it cuts through older wall-paintings from the 14th century. (fig. 20) This would have permitted the nuns to reach the gallery from the cloister without ever setting foot in the church. And the nuns never used the ground floor of the church. A recently published document, the Notel der Küsterin, a notebook of the sacristan, gives an
extraordinary detailed report on the everyday life and the feasts’ of the nuns.\textsuperscript{47} From this

\textsuperscript{47} See Weilandt, "Alltag einer Küsterin."
Fig. 18: Nuremberg, St. Lorenz,  
*Martyrdom of St. Catherine*; Archive of the author.
Fig. 19: Nuremberg, *St. Katharina*, interior looking west; Archive of the author.

Fig. 20: Nuremberg, *St. Katharina*, nuns’ choir, north wall; Archive of the author.
document we know that the nuns did not leave the enclosure at all after taking the veil. The sacristan alone cared for the liturgical vestments used by the priest and the altars in the outer church which were decorated for the feasts. Unlike the rest of the church, the western gallery was part of the enclosure and the liturgy of the nuns took place there. The gallery was separated from the church by a high balustrade through which the nuns could see neither the floor of the church nor the high altar. Only on a single, but very crucial occasion, could they could cast a glance at the altar. During the daily Mass celebrated there, a Gatter or grille, in the balustrade was opened to let the nuns see what was going on at the altar. Above all they wanted to look at the Holy Sacrament being elevated by the priest for transubstantiation. On Sunday in the octave of Corpus Christi, a public procession came from the nearby hospital of the Holy Ghost to St. Katharina. The Notel demands: “And when the sacristan hears them, she opens Our Lord [that is the sacrament house in the nuns’ choir] but she may not open the grille.” (Und wen si die küsterin höret, so tut si unsern herren auf, aber die gatern bedarf si nit auf sperren.) The clear purpose of this measure was to prevent any contact with the public. The nuns venerated the Holy Sacrament strictly separated from the laity. Thus, during the reading of the hours in the choir, the doors of the church were locked to avoid any acoustic interference. The same happened during the daily Mass, except for the servants of the monastery who were allowed to be present.

Apart from such occasions the eastern choir with the high altar and the shrine of St. Catharine was open to everyone. Yet, we don’t know whether there was a screen to separate the nave from the choir. It was not necessary, in any case, since the nuns did not set foot in it at all. Therefore, the pilgrims could move freely when they visited the shrine of St. Catherine on her feast day. The Notel gives precise instructions. At the beginning of the day, around prime, the sacristan: “carries everything out, the relics and panels and images and what other pretty things she has, she carries everything to the door so that nothing beautiful remains in the choir [that is the nun’s choir on the eastern gallery]. She must hand out relic stands for the holy heads and borrow more things from the sisters. And the alms dish and the alms board and the big diploma with the numerous seals and the great carpet in front of the altar [that is the high altar] ... She also has to stick flags to the altars in the church and two big flags in the middle of the church.” Everything was mobilized to decorate the church, including several objects of private devotion taken from the nuns and made accessible for public veneration. This is very instructive in so far as it shows that panels like the small triptychs, often regarded as private altarpieces or Hausaltärchen, served not only for the
use of the nuns, but for the decoration of the altars in the church, if necessary. There was no strict distinction between private devotional images and public altarpieces in the convent of St. Katharina.

The display of splendor in the outer church was in sharp contrast to the simple decoration of the nun’s choir on the feast day of St. Catherine. The sacristan spread “the black altar cloth with the plants or which one she likes” – nothing more, although on other feasts the nuns’ choir was decorated at great expense with relics, paintings, and sculptures. On St. Catherine’s feast day, they exhibited the big diploma with the numerous seals in the outer church, which spelled out the privilege of indulgence. Many people came here to attain these privileges and to give their alms. It was the day devoted to the pilgrims, not to the nuns, who stayed on their gallery and celebrated the feast in peace. The strangers could walk around freely in the richly-adorned church, unhindered by the nuns. Because of this, the narrow single-nave choir of St. Catherine granted a considerably better and undisturbed access to the shrine of the saint than the huge hall choir of St. Sebald. The choir that at first sight appeared to be so incommodious for pilgrimage was thoroughly suited for that purpose in the end. It is not form but function that makes the difference. In St. Sebald the frequent prayers and Masses of the clerics prevented access by the public for the most part of the day, while in St. Catherine the liturgy left more time for the public visitation in terms of the hours and the single daily Mass.
The Vanquished Synagogue, the Risen Host, and the Grateful Dead at the Salvatorkirche in Passau

By Mitchell B. Merback

Ever since Richard Krautheimer’s pathfinding 1942 article introducing the “iconography of medieval architecture,” scholars have sharpened our understanding of the homologies linking new edifices with their models, even in cases when the two designs, new and old, seem at great variance from one another. Rather than explaining such formal differences by positing an interruption in transmission, Krautheimer was interested in the medieval conceptual habit of assimilating divergent forms into a unity on the basis of their perceived symbolic, or even mystical, affinities. Revealingly, Krautheimer’s analysis focused on central-plan structures built as “replicas” of the fourth-century Church of the Resurrection (Anastasis) in Jerusalem, a domed rotunda of Constantinian origin, surrounding the aedicule enshrining the Tomb of Christ, a

48 This article is an expanded version of a lecture first delivered at the Society of Architectural Historians Annual Meeting in April 2004; and again, one year later, in modified form, at the Herron School of Art, Indianapolis. Thanks to colleagues and students at both venues for the valuable comments. Research was funded by the National Endowment for the Humanities. Indispensable assistance and advice came from Dr. Herbert Wurster, Director of the Diocesan Archives in Passau. Both Jacqueline E. Jung and Gerhard Lutz (who also kindly assisted with photos) lent considerable expertise to their careful readings of a draft, though neither could rescue me entirely from venturing certain imprudent assertions. Unless otherwise noted, translations are my own.

49 For a critical reappraisal of some of the foundational assumptions of the “iconology of architecture,” especially with regard to central-plan buildings, see Matthias Untermann, Der Zentralbau im Mittelalter. Form ~ Funktion ~ Verbreitung (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1989), 46-52; as a corrective to the missteps of iconological research, the author emphasizes the cultic and social functions of individual buildings (Bauaufgabe) on a case by case basis (see analysis especially on 48ff).
complex known today as the Church of the Holy Sepulchre.\textsuperscript{50} (fig. 1) Examples of such “Holy Sepulchre copies” can be traced from the fifth to the seventeenth centuries and pertain to three types of monuments. There are full-scale churches such as Neuvy-Saint-Sepulcre (\textit{circa} 1045); attached chapels such as the round Moritzkapelle, built at Constance Cathedral by Bishop Konrad (934-75) after returning from his second pilgrimage to the Holy Land around 960;\textsuperscript{51} and independent mortuary chapels, for example, the Michaelskapelle at Fulda, dating to around 820 (the type of the centrally-planned charnel house, or \textit{Karner}, discussed later in this essay, belongs in this third category). Krautheimer made the crucial observation that these “copies” rarely corresponded to the plan or elevation of the Anastasis rotunda. A center-room, circular or octagonal, wrapped by an ambulatory on one or two levels, a given number of supports,\textsuperscript{52} a set of “holy measurements” derived from the prototype -- it was the presence of these features, rather than an abiding verisimilitude, that signaled the allegiance to the model; but, equally crucial is the fact that none of these features, save the general orientation of the building, were indispensable as referents. Models were “never imitated \textit{in toto},” explained Krautheimer, “the medieval beholder expected to find in a copy only some parts of the prototype but not by any


\textsuperscript{51} Krautheimer, 6; this was the second of Konrad’s three pilgrimages. Note that the original tenth-century Holy Sepulchre copy, a chapel built northeast of the choir of Constance Münster, was highly ornamented with goldwork (Untermann, 58-9); this earlier piece was replaced around 1260 with the surviving twelve-sided sepulchre, which takes the form of a tower-shaped ciborium adorned with figural decoration.

\textsuperscript{52} As the Anastasis rotunda has twenty supports (eight piers and twelve columns), imitators felt free to choose either number and use this in the design of the copy, regardless of the shape of the supports being used (Krautheimer,10).

\textsuperscript{53} These “holy measurements” are typically a corresponding diameter, or an exact halving of the diameter, of the Anastasis rotunda; see Reinle, 127.
1. View of interior, Anastasis Rotunda (begun c. 325-35), Church of the Holy Sepulchre, Jerusalem (Photo: Author)
means all of them.”

Even the ambulatory might be subtracted, as was the case in the so-called Busdorfkirche at Paderborn, consecrated in 1036. To grasp the genealogy connecting these buildings requires, therefore, that we think in terms of what Krautheimer called “network[s] of reciprocal half-distinct connotations” -- of which there are two kinds. One kind arises from a building’s “material” form, the visible features that signal an allegiance of copy to prototype; the other arises from those “immaterial” affiliations that link buildings ecclesiologically and often mystically. In this article I proceed from my own intuition that the interplay of these two kinds of connotation, the “material” and the “immaterial,” can be particularly valuable in understanding the cultural functions of pilgrimage architecture.

From the twelfth century onward, instead of traveling great distances to the sacred sites in Palestine and Rome, the great majority of Christians began visiting local, European surrogates for the holy places. Architectural copies of famous edifices helped foster this new condition, offering the pilgrim, in Krautheimer’s words, an “echo of the original capable of reminding [him] of the venerated site, of evoking his devotion and of giving him a share at least in the reflections of the blessings which he would have enjoyed if he had been able to visit the Holy Site in reality.” As a description of how architecture could shape religious perceptions among visitors to a given shrine, these are accurate, but also cautious words. For Krautheimer, the surrogacy of the copy breaks off at the level of remembrance (the experience available to those who actually visited the prototype) and evocation (for those who never could). Thus the perceived relationship reaches no farther than the level of devotion and its accompanying mental states. But might there be a deeper level where surrogate and prototype were seen to conjoin? We know that in medieval thinking about symbols, unlike its supposed modern counterpart, signs were not always clearly separable from their referents; copies often participated in a mystical unity with their originals, and sacred things -- relics both primary and secondary, holy images and certainly the consecrated host itself -- could be perceived as consubstantial with their prototypes. Thus copies of sacred

---

54 Also acknowledged in his theory is the “collateral influence” other buildings resembling or copied from the prototype exerted on subsequent copies, a notion suggestive of a circularity in the system of connotation, an “intervisual” substitutionality that reinforced not so much the formal as the symbolic authority of any form emanating from the original.

55 The dissimilarity of the Busdorfkirche from the Jerusalem prototype caused considerable surprise when it was excavated in 1935, and prompted speculation that Wino of Helmarshausen, the monk whom Bishop Meinwerk sent to Jerusalem to make measurements of the Holy Sepulchre complex, had been unable to comprehend the building from its ruins (it had been destroyed in 1009), and instead relied on observations of another building seen on his travels; see discussion in E. Den Hartog, *Romanesque Architecture and Sculpture in the Meuse Valley* (Mechelen: Eisma B. V., Leeuwarden, 1992), 37, who cites R. Wesenberg, “Wino von Helmarshausen und das kreuzförmige Oktogon,” *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte* 12 (1949): 30-40. Note also that the Paderborn church was originally dedicated (in 777) as a Church of the Holy Savior (Salvatorkirche).

56 Krautheimer, 16.

57 And, as anyone who has observed pilgrim-behavior at shrines must realize, the power of sacred objects is felt to be a quasi-material property, a charged essence that can be transferred through touch and vision. This is the most ordinary and democratic means for the transfer and proliferation of sanctity; the kind of mystical and “non-material” connections that obtained between prototype and copy perhaps belong in a different category of proliferation.
things were often felt to share in the sanctity of the original, and therefore were capable of the same ritual efficacy. The broadest part of my argument here is that much the same can be said for architectural copies: that the built environment, even the stones themselves, could become vehicles for the transposition of sanctity -- if not divine immanence itself -- and therefore especially efficacious as places for ritual and cultic practice.

Among the areas of ritual and cultic practice associated with pilgrimage where this perception of sanctity’s immanence in architecture might seem to be operative, I want to call attention to the cult of the purgatorial dead. In the present state of research one finds the great variety of commemorative, intercessionary, and penitential aspirations connected with Christian mortuary practice, in particular the cult of purgatory, but linked only indirectly to pilgrimage. Yet multiple direct points of contact can be detected if we know where to look. Central was the system of indulgences, earned and often purchased by the living for the dead; pilgrims carried their prayers as well as their coins to sites where both might bring spiritual benefit to the dead, whose spiritual aspirations were served by proxy through works of mercy. A pen and colored ink drawing from a miscellany produced in Nuremberg around 1480, a manuscript containing among other texts the “Seven Works of Mercy,” depicts the “poor souls” (Arme Seeelen) in purgatory as an almost palpable presence beneath the feet of pilgrims on their way to church. (fig. 2) These connections are well known to scholars.

Now juxtapose this with all that scholars such as Krautheimer, Wolfgang Götz (1968), Reto Feurer (1980), Adolf Reinle (1976), and Matthias Untermann (1989), have taught us about the long-standing symbiosis between central-plan architecture and the twin domains of processes.

58 On the conception of stone’s intrinsic potency and related issues, see Hans Gerhard Evers, Tod, Macht und Raum als Bereiche der Architektur (Munich: Filser, 1939; repr. Munich: Wilhelm Fink, 1970), esp. pp. 63-92. The conclusions of Evers, an author influenced by National Socialist thinking, should be used with caution.

59 Some of my thinking about the ritual efficacy of place, in particular the operative values given to place by the “double structure” of event and memorial found in foundation myths, is indebted to Jonathan Z. Smith, To Take Place: Toward Theory in Ritual (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987).

2. South German (Nuremberg?), *Pilgrims doing good works for poor souls*, colored pen drawing from manuscript of c. 1480 (Nürnberg Stadtbibliothek., Handschrift Cent. V, App. 34a, fol. 129v)
pilgrimage and mortuary practice. Although the antecedents are well-known and the field expansive, a few points may be summarized. In early Christianity, the domed center room became the characteristic form for tombs of martyrs (martyria) and, after the fourth century, baptistries as well. That these rites of passage, death and birth, burial and resurrection, were seen by visitors to the tombs as somehow enacted at a very precise locus, along an invisible “sacred axis” connecting heaven and earth, had enormous implications for Christian sacred architecture. Baptismal and mortuary rites are both coded in terms of Easter ceremonial; and rotundas and octagonal center-rooms ultimately came to bear this symbolic association. Other kinds of relics, especially Passion relics (allegedly) brought to Europe from the Holy Land, were frequently enshrined in round or octagonal chapels, or under elaborately vaulted ceilings resembling a ciborium, as a way of conferring dignity and sanctity upon these objects. Supreme in this class of relics were specimens of the Holy Blood. Thus the idea of the pilgrimage chapel as a place of veneration, coupled with its long-standing commemorative function and its associations with resurrection and rebirth, found their characteristic, if not their paradigmatic form in the central-plan structure.

One late medieval edifice in which these connections come into a startling focus is the former collegiate and pilgrimage Church of the Holy Savior (Sankt Salvator) in Passau, in Lower Bavaria, a compact, but elegant three-bay structure with a polygonal choir, an open crypt and beautiful stellar rib vaults characteristic of the “Danube Late Gothic.” Though remodeled several times in its 525-year history, the present structure is virtually identical with the church begun on August 16, 1479 under the powerful prince-bishop Ulrich III von Nußdorf. Thanks to its remote location, a fire which consumed the Altstadt in 1662 left the church untouched, and it stands today as the only intact medieval structure in the city. It also condenses an extraordinary history. Little more than one year prior to its foundation, Bishop Ulrich had overseen the expulsion of the Jews from his residential city following the trial and execution of several men -- four accused Jews and their Christian accomplice-turned-accuser -- implicated in a conspiracy to

61 Published works by authors in this list are cited in various places below; in addition to which, see Reto Feurer, “Wallfahrt und Wallfahrtsarchitektur. Versuch einer Vergegenwärtigung des Fragencomplexes” (dissertation, University of Zurich, 1980), whom I have not consulted as completely as the other authors mentioned here.

62 V[eronica] Sekules, “Easter Sepulchre,” in The Dictionary of Art (New York: Grove), IX: 680-2, here p. 680. Two other examples may be noted, both bearing the title Heilig Kreuz: a) for a highly-venerated Holy Blood relic, acquired in 923, a simple round chapel was built at Reichenau Monastery and attached in the east to the monastery church; b) a Heiliges Grab, decorated with goldwork and polychrome, was erected inside a large round chapel at the monastery of St. Gallen under Abbott Ulrich (984-90), and built east of the monastery church.

63 At the St. Jakobskirche in Rothenburg ob der Tauber, for example, an octagonal chapel served as the ostensorium for one of Bavaria’s famous blood-relics, and became the locus of a pilgrimage of some importance (see fig. 12 and discussion below). Holger Simon has challenged the widely-held assumption that the pilgrimages to the two key Holy Blood sites in Franconia with important altarpieces by Tilman Riemenschneider, Rothenburg and Creglingen (Church of Our Lord, dedicated 1389), attracted large number of pilgrims from beyond their immediate locales; see Der Creglinger Marienaltar von Tilman Riemenschneider (Berlin: Verlag für Wissenschaft und Forschung, 1998), esp. 17-18.
desecrate the body of Christ in the Eucharist. To make way for the new church, which was to be symbolically placed at the very site of the sacrilege, one or more buildings in the Jewish area of the Ilzstadt, one of them apparently housing a Schul (therefore functioning as a synagogue) were demolished. While the precise scope and timing of the area’s transformation can certainly do with further questioning, it can not be doubted that the narrative trope which imagines the new church built either “on the site [of]” (an der Stelle) or, in the words of the famous broadsheet created around 1498 to commemorate the events, “from” the Jewish synagogue (aus der jüden synagog), dates to the earliest phase of the shrine’s career. Secularized in 1803, sold off to become a saltpeter factory (!) in 1811, repurchased and renovated by the Bishop Heinrich von Hofstätter in 1861, damaged and again closed after 1945, the church now stands empty, confounding city planners, who cannot find a viable use for it, and tourists, to whom the building is sometimes pointed out, by local tour guides, as Passau’s “former synagogue.”

At first glance, the Salvatorkirche offers an unlikely test case for exploring the “network of half-distinct reciprocal connotations” that obtained in Holy Sepulchre copies because it is difficult to show, conclusively, that the design -- which corresponds in many aspects to the south German tradition of the interior wall-buttress church (Wandpfeilerkirche) -- refers to the Anastasis rotunda. That the form and plan of the Salvatorkirche are symbolic in some way has, 


66 This will be discussed in my book in preparation, Pilgrimage and Pogrom: Anti-Jewish Myth, Violence and Visual Culture in Late Medieval Germany and Austria.

67 As attested, for example, in a letter of 9 Sept. 1993, to Passau's mayor from a recent tourist from Israel; Stadtarchiv Passau, misc. records for “St. Salvator, Passau-Ilzstadt”. In a public ceremony in March 2005 the Salvatorkirche, following the completion of restoration work on its roof, received a new inscribed plaque recalling the building’s origins in anti-Jewish persecution.

68 Viertlböck, 111-12.
however, long been assumed in the literature. Rather than offer a formal analysis to prove this, however, I endeavor here to outline the intersections of architectural form and cult function discoverable in the building’s history. What emerges is an image of the Salvatorkirche as more than a stage for liturgy and Christological cult -- rather, I will argue that its form and physical fabric, its site and the prehistory that shaped it, made the church a new kind of surrogate holy place, one in which a quasi-magical potency served to vouchsafe the rituals and cult practices performed inside it. This potency came from the Real Presence of the historical, suffering body of Christ, made manifest in the consecrated host through miracle, to be specific, a miracle prompted by sacrilegious violence: pierced with a knife and later cast into an oven by the “perfidious Jews” of Christian fantasy, the bleeding host of Passau, the local legend tells us, survived its ordeal and was resurrected from its fiery tomb, a victorious prelude to the Jews’ expulsion from the city and the inauguration of a pilgrimage.

We can now proceed to sketch four areas of evidence that support this interpretation of the Salvatorkirche. They are: the architectural evidence; the mortuary evidence; the ecclesiological and cultic evidence; and the mytho-narrative evidence, whose principal source is the city’s localized version of the European host-desecration legend, unique among its relatives across this region for having entered the documentary record within a generation of the shrine’s construction.

Form, Passage, Display

First the architectural evidence, with an eye toward the building’s organization as a pilgrimage church. Expertly set like a faceted gem against the steep, overgrown eastern slope of the St.-Georges-Berg, with the buildings of the Veste Oberhaus looming above, the simple planar forms of the Salvatorkirche, despite their vertical insistence, convey the impression of a structure anchored to its site. (fig. 3) The repeated buildup of the modern streets surrounding it, having effectively obscured the lowest section of the building from lateral view, exaggerates the effect. Still, the elegant proportions of the church cannot escape notice. Their harmony is neatly captured in the coordination of windows around the three eastern sides of the polygon and across the two stories still visible from the street level.

From virtually every approach, the Salvatorkirche gives the impression of a central-plan building. A three-story, rectangular annex with a gabled roof and a ridge turret from the nineteenth century -- which once had the function of a belltower -- enhance this impression by concealing the south flank of the nave, just as a broad, enclosed staircase and the old collegiate residence conceals the north flank. And once inside the two-storied sanctuary the impression is hardly dispelled. (fig. 4) But this is no central-plan structure in the strict sense, as the groundplan reveals. (fig. 5) An abruptly terminated west end -- almost abutting the rock cliff into which the foundations are set -- looms up over an aisle-less, three-bay nave that merges with a 3/8-polygonal choir. Between the robust abutment-piers, which extend to almost the entire
4. Interior view of nave and choir, former Collegiate and Pilgrimage Church of the Holy Savior (Sankt Salvator), Passau, begun 1479, engraving (Source: Die Kunstdenkmäler von Niederbayern III: Stadt Passau, ed. Felix Mader [Munich, 1919])

height of the nave and resemble exterior buttresses turned inward, the architect has cut niches whose appearance of depth depends a great deal on lighting conditions; in flatter light these draw the unified space of the sanctuary out toward the windows of the eastern walls while giving a strong, plastic articulation to the central enclosure. A gallery divides the elevation roughly in half; a tracery balustrade wreathes the interior and laterally binds the vertical weight of the piers. Staggered into a lower position on the westernmost pier, it completes the integration of the nave with the stately western choir loft, which appears as a wide horizontal balcony supported by a triple-arched porch (an arrangement strongly resembling French and German choir screens). Coupled with the height and the dizzying effect of the rhomboid vaults, the width of the sanctuary -- just barely surpassing its length -- emphasizes what Wolfgang Götz calls the “centralizing tendency” (Zentralbautendenz) in certain kinds of Gothic buildings (not only centrally-planned ones). This characteristic of the Salvatorkirche has been noted by nearly all of the building’s commentators.

The coordination of chapels set between massive interior abutment-piers at Sankt Salvator was preceded in several important Bavarian and Austrian buildings such as St. Martin’s in Landshut (Lower Bavaria; begun in 1407), the choir of the Franciscan Church in Salzburg (begun in 1408), and St. Martin’s in Amberg (Oberpfalz, begun in 1421). At Passau, however, it provides a vital clue to the building’s intended function as a pilgrimage church. Salzburg, Amberg and Passau each displays the “double-register chapelled extensions [which] developed into a specific hall type with gallery.” The coordinated upper chapels of the gallery at Passau strongly resemble the arrangements at other Wandpfeilerkirchen such as Amberg, but their functions differ. At Amberg, according to Norbert Nussbaum, “the upper registers of the chapelled extensions were reserved, at least most of them, for the Donatores of the chapels directly below them.” By contrast, at the Salvatorkirche the gallery seems to have served as a ring of compartments for pilgrims processing though the building and seeking a view of the relics on display in the sanctuary below.

Other distinctive features of the plan reinforce the supposition that, as a pilgrimage church, Sankt Salvator was designed to serve primarily as a place of ritualized relic veneration. Multiple

69 For a brilliant reassessment of the choir screen’s form and function, see Jacqueline E. Jung, “Beyond the Barrier: The Unifying Role of the Choir Screen in Gothic Churches,” Art Bulletin 82, no. 4 (December 2000): 622-57.


72 Ibid.

73 Viertlböck, 111.
points of access and egress set up a variety of passages through the building; staircases are conspicuously broad to accommodate processions. To enter the main sanctuary one must ascend a long, stair tunnel on the north side -- a kind of “holy stair” or heilige Steig -- and pass through a pair of tall doors opposite the old provost’s quarters. Then, a likely circuit through the church would lead under the west gallery loft to a terraced stair, then around the choir via the gallery, and then down the southwest stair under the loft. (fig. 6) Egress could then be made onto a porch between the south annex and the western stair tower. Here one finds a formerly-handsome vestibule, spanned by a stellar rib vault, which once led out onto a terrace that almost certainly served as tribune for the public ostentation of the church’s relics, a ritual likely performed in the manner of the annual Heiltumsweisung at the monastery church at Andechs, in Upper Bavaria (an edifice clearly studied by the architect of the Salvatorkirche). An engraving made in Augsburg by Alexander Mair in 1608 portrays the ordered, but festive gathering of pious folk atop the Holy Mountain at Andechs, with boat traffic on the Ammersee visible in the background. (fig. 7) A prelate leads the liturgical exposition from the tapestry-draped south window which serves as a tribune. This type of staging appears to be typical for south Germany.

Essentially, then, we have in the upper zones of the Salvatorkirche a “centralized” nave as an open center space, ringed by niche-chapels, integrated with a gallery above. Are these “material” features alone sufficient to bring the edifice into that network of connotations, theorized by Krautheimer, which signal an affiliation with the Jerusalem prototype? This question may be held in suspension as we consider the architecture and function of the lower level.
6. View of area under west loft and SW stair, former Collegiate and Pilgrimage Church of the Holy Savior (Sankt Salvator), Passau, begun 1479 (Photo: Author)
The Lower Chapel

A second area of evidence concerns the former mortuary and cultic functions of the lower chapel, opened for restoration work in 2002 and seen here in a photograph from that year. (fig. 8) Gothic crypt chapels, like this one, represent a significant departure from an earlier type of two-aisled crypt with a polygonal eastern terminus (Hallenkrypta); the new, centralizing designs were typically round or octagonal chambers, organized around a central column with radiating rib vaults. Whereas in English, Austrian, and German monasteries such arrangements were the preferred design for chapter houses, in many German monasteries and princely Stifte, installations such as this served as a type of ossuary for monks and prelates, princes and their family members. At Passau we have reports of tomb inscriptions from the area around the crypt’s main altar (which was dedicated to the Holy Cross in 1483 under Bishop Ulrich’s successor, Friedrich Mauerkircher). According to nineteenth-century historians, tombstones for deacons, canons, and prebendaries of the collegiate monastery here (Kollegiatstift) once filled the entire space, while the southern vestibule (fig. 9) may have once contained the tombs of one or more of the provosts. All of these tombs were uprooted and emptied after the church was secularized and sold between 1803 and 1811.

The plan of the Passau crypt chapel is a 5/8-polygon, corresponding to the choir above. (fig. 10) As the sectional diagram reveals, (fig. 11) the architect established a strong vertical coordination between the upper and lower spaces, each one a carefully modeled spatial unity, over which complex net vaults are suspended. All the more than the upper church, then, the

76 For example, at the former Cistercian monastery of Eberbach, chapter house, vaulted 1345; reproduced in Nussbaum, 109; Götz, fig. 16. An important Austrian example is found at the Cistercian monastery at Zwettl; see Renate Wagner-Rieger, Mittelalterliche Architektur in Österreich, ed. Artur Rosenauer and Mario Schwarz (St. Pöltten: Niederösterreichisches Presseshaus, 1988), plate III; and Götz, fig. 15. Prominent among the English examples is the two-leveled octagonal chapter house and crypt at Westminster Abbey, built between 1245 and 1253; discussed in Götz, 30, figs. 101-02.

77 Götz, 250. Mortuary functions are clearly traceable for the Gothic central-crypts in Neuenburg in western Prussia (Minoriten-Kloster-Kirche), Schweidnitz in Silesia (parish church), Breslau (Martinikapelle), Bad Doberan, Lienz in East Tyrol (Andreaskirche), Jena (Michaelskirche), and can be inferred for many others of similar design, such as the Moritzkapelle in Constance, which was built over a cemetery.

78 A now-lost inscription from the crypt window marked the dedication: “Anno domini MCCCLXXXIII regnante reverendissimo in Christo patre Domino Friderico electo et confirmato Ecclesiae pataviensis consumata est praesens crypta ecclesiae Salvatoris et consecrata in honor sanctae crucis”; repr. in Ludwig Heinrich Krick, Alte Inschriften an den Gebäuden der Stadt Passau und deren nachster Umgebung (Passau: Waldbauer, 1925), 21; cf. Viertlböck, 112.

8. Lower chapel, view toward north, former Collegiate and Pilgrimage Church of the Holy Savior (Sankt Salvator), Passau, begun 1479 (Photo: Author)

9. South vestibule of lower chapel, former Collegiate and Pilgrimage Church of the Holy Savior (Sankt Salvator), Passau, begun 1479 (Photo: Author)

The geometry of this subterranean chapel expresses the central-plan tendency of the whole edifice; covered by a domed vault, spanned by a six-pointed curving star, the intended effect is clearly that of a monumental reliquary shrine or ciborium. This intention is reflected in the striking similarities of plan between Passau and the polygonal crypt below the Holy Blood Chapel (*Hl.-Blut-Kapelle*), built as a western extension of the St. Jakobskirche in Rothenburg ob der Tauber (c. 1453-71). At Rothenburg we have an eight-pointed star vault centering the plan, with ribs radiating outward to the corners of the polygon. As important as the formal is the functional parallel: the Rothenburg chapel’s lower level once served as a relic-treasury for the Holy Blood specimen. With its broad western wall that truncates the plan where the chapel abuts the rock face, Passau’s lower level also resembles the crypt chapels at Neuenburg (Franciscan Priory Church) and at Lienz (Church of St. Andreas) in east Tirol. At Lienz, in particular, which served as a burial site for the Counts of Görz, we see the same polygonal plan organized beneath an eight-pointed stellar vault. Both crypt interiors, Lienz and Passau, are circumscribed by a stone socle-bench, a feature of chapter houses that is also indicative of a necrological function for the space.

That such crypts closely paralleled the form and function of the south German charnel house, or *Karner*, can hardly escape notice. Behind these structures lies the practice of secondary burial, the reclamation of excarnated bones and their protection in ossuaries, individual or collective; the practice has ancient roots and defies review here. Monumental charnel houses can be traced back to the twelfth century and emerged as a standard part of medieval mortuary practice across Europe in the following century. Over one hundred examples of circular or polygonal charnel houses survive in the contiguous regions of Austria, Bavaria and Bohemia in designs that preserve “the ancient link between the tomb of Christ and the graves of

---

80 At Rothenburg a two-storied extension is divided from the larger church by a street (Klingengasse) which passes through it; for the plan and general description, see *Die Kunstdenkmäler von Mittelfranken VIII: Stadt Rothenburg ob der Tauber, Kirchliche Bauten*, ed. Anton Ress (Munich: Oldenbourg, 1959), 73-74 and 79; and Götz, 246. On the chapel and pilgrimage, see Ludwig Schnurrer, “Kapelle und Wallfahrt zum Heiligen Blut in Rothenburg,” in *Rothenburg im Mittelalter. Studien zur Geschichte einer fränkischen Reichsstadt* (Rothenburg, 1997), 389-400.

81 Götz, 246.

82 First mentioned in 1022/1039 ("in loco Luentzina"), converted to a Gothic basilica and re-consecrated Oct. 9, 1457 (www.stadt-lienz.at/index.asp).

83 Götz, 238-9.

84 Though only Lienz further unifies the design with a system of blind niches in the choir walls; three deeper niches in the western wall there appear to have been reserved for tombs.

the faithful,” according to Justin E. A. Kroesen.\footnote{Justin E. A. Kroesen, The Sepulchrum Domini through the Ages: Its Form and Function, trans. Margaret Kofod (Leuven/Paris/Sterling, VA: Peeters, 2000). Examples include Mödling, Pulkau (fig. 14), Tulln (fig. 16), and Bad Deutsch Altenburg (in Austria), and Bad Doberan (in Germany); for fundamentals, see Friedrich Zoepfl, “Beinhaus,” Realexikon zur Deutschen Kunstgeschichte, ed. Otto Schmitt (Stuttgart-Waldsee: Alfred Druckenmüller, 1948), cols. 204-14.} Here I show, first, the charnel house in the churchyard of St. Michaels, in Pulkau (Lower Austria), just a few hundred meters away from the reputed site of another infamous host-desecration in 1338.\footnote{Built between 1219 and 1221, the Pulkau charnel house first appears in documents in 1430 as “Kapelle zum Heiligen Grab”; see Geschichte der bildenden Kunst in Österreich, Bd. I: Frühund Hochmittelalter, ed. Hermann Fillitz (Munich: Prestel, 1997), no. 64 (pp. 293-94). On the Pulkau host-desecration affair and its resonances in the visual culture of that city’s Holy Blood shrine, see my forthcoming article, “Fount of Grace, City of Blood: Cultic Anti-Judaism and the Pulkau Passion Altarpiece,” Art Bulletin 87, no. 4 (December 2005).} Many of these independent, central-plan mortuary chapels were known as Herrgottsruihkäppellen, or were dedicated sub voce sancti sepulchri, indicating their abiding symbolic affiliation with the Tomb of Christ; one can even find documentary evidence that some central-plan crypts themselves carried the popular designation Karner!\footnote{In addition to Lienz and Kourim, this occurs at the parish church of St. Matthew in Murau (Steiermark); see Götz, 239.}

86\footnote{For Kourim, see Götz, 237-8.}

87\footnote{As Götz summarizes: “So dürften die zentralen Krypten der Gotik sicher als die reinsten Vertreter von Räumen gelten, die in engem Sinnzusammenhang mit Karner und HI. Grab noch immer die Zentralbaugestalt von Memorie und Martyrium nachwirken lassen” (246).} Here we find not only a crypt but an even deeper chamber, or Gruft, beneath it, recalling the two-tiered design of charnel houses in which the upper level, furnished with an altar for funeral masses, served as a memorial chapel, and the lower level as an ossuary.\footnote{For Kourim, see Götz, 237-8.} A formal and symbolic homology therefore exists between the charnel house and the central-plan crypt -- as central plan structures with explicit mortuary functions, both were perceived as representations of the “Heiliggräbrkirche” in Jerusalem and functioned ritually as its local surrogate.\footnote{As Götz summarizes: “So dürften die zentralen Krypten der Gotik sicher als die reinsten Vertreter von Räumen gelten, die in engem Sinnzusammenhang mit Karner und HI. Grab noch immer die Zentralbaugestalt von Memorie und Martyrium nachwirken lassen” (246).} One may even compare the overall conception of the Salvatoriskirche to the design-type based on a half-subterranean ossuary crypt with a chapel of corresponding plan raised above it (and accessible via an exterior stair). In Lower Austria such a design is found at Tulln (c. 1270-80), the oldest example of a regular polygonal crypt with central column and star-vaults. Here we find not only a crypt but an even deeper chamber, or Gruft, beneath it, recalling the two-tiered design of charnel houses in which the upper level, furnished with an altar for funeral masses, served as a memorial chapel, and the lower level as an ossuary.\footnote{As Götz summarizes: “So dürften die zentralen Krypten der Gotik sicher als die reinsten Vertreter von Räumen gelten, die in engem Sinnzusammenhang mit Karner und HI. Grab noch immer die Zentralbaugestalt von Memorie und Martyrium nachwirken lassen” (246).}
14. Charnel House, cemetery of the Parish Church of St. Michael, Pulkau, Lower Austria, begun 1219-1221 (Photo: Author)

1250), on the Danube between Krems and Vienna, then part of the Passau diocese.⁹⁰ (fig. 16)

**Patron-title and Cultic Connotations**

Among the “immaterial” connotations that reveal the place of the Salvatorkirche within the intertwined histories of Holy Sepulchre copies and central-plan pilgrimage shrines, perhaps the most important is its patron-title: *Sankt Salvator* (roughly translatable as “Holy Savior”). Prior to the erection of the Salvatorkirche, at least twenty-seven Eucharistic shrines, spread across ten German dioceses, received the stamp of Holy Savior patronage, or bore some other connection to it.⁹¹ Through this title new shrines were linked to a long and venerable line of episcopal, royal and imperial foundations, leading back to Charlemagne and even beyond, to Constantine.⁹² Not only the mighty early basilicas, but a number of important early central-plan churches conceived as Holy Sepulchre replicas, for example at Fulda (discussed below), carried the patronage title of *S. Salvatoris*.⁹³ Fed by these two traditions, the patron-title chosen by Bishop Ulrich clearly betokens an effort to promote the Salvatorkirche as an episcopal foundation of special dignity. Scion of a Bavarian noble family, Bishop Ulrich seems to have intended the church’s relic collection -- which included several “secondary eucharistic relics” associated with the Jewish sacrilege against the *corpus Christi* -- as a public emblem of his authority.⁹⁴

---

⁹⁰ Reproduced in Zoepfl, fig. 3.

⁹¹ From the list assembled by Adolf Ostendorf, “Das Salvador-Patrocinium, seine Anfänge und seine Ausbreitung im mittelalterlichen Deutschland,” *Westfälische Zeitschrift*, 100 (1950): 357-76, here 373-74. I count twenty-seven eucharistic shrines in ten different modern diocese and archdiocese in Germany and Austria (Regensburg, Eichstätt, München-Freising, Salzburg, Passau, Bamberg, Rottenburg, Halberstadt, Ermland, Cologne) with some connection to the Holy Savior title; of these, nine are associated with host-miracles or host-desecration legends.

⁹² Viertlböck (110-11) notes this connection; see also Zimmerman 42ff. For the early history of the patron-title, see Ostendorf, with a list of Holy Savior churches founded under Constantine on 359, with further references.


⁹⁴ Ulrich von Nußdorf came to the episcopate after a distinguished career; a doctor of canon law, he had served as notary to King Ladislaus of Poland and Hungary, cathedral canon in Passau and cathedral provost in Freising. Yet his election, like that of his predecessor Leonhard von Laymingen (1424-51), the tentative outcome of power brokering among imperial and papal parties, the cathedral chapter and the Duke of Bavaria, suffered a good deal in princely dignity; see August Leidl, “Nußdorf, Ulrich von († 1479),” in *Die Bischöfe des Heiligen Römischen Reiches 1448 bis 1648. Ein biographisches Lexikon*, ed. Erwin Gatz (Berlin: Duncker & Humblot, 1996), 507-08.
16. Charnel House, Tulln, Lower Austria. c. 1250 (Photo: Gerhard Lutz).
A second link between the Salvatorkirche and the tradition of Holy Sepulchre copies is found in the crypt, and in a cross-association with another patron-title. Holy Sepulchre replicas in the Middle Ages mostly bore dedicatory names like San Sepulcro, zum Heiligen Grab, etc., but others, such as the rotunda at Eichstätt, Germany’s oldest, could be dedicated with the double title, “zum Heiligen Grab und Heiligen Kreuz.”95 (fig. 17) Precisely this latter patron-title -- Holy Cross -- was given to the Passau crypt, dedicated in 1483. It may also be noted in this regard that, in cases where we can trace the existence of a temporary “Easter sepulchre” (sepulchrum domini) inside a church, the south German evidence points strongly to a close association of the sepulchre with Holy Cross altars.96 Together, Holy Sepulchre, Holy Cross, the bleeding host, and the variety of relics all point to an underlying Passion theme linking south Germany’s host-miracle churches with the Roman “station church” that was the principal repository of Passion relics in the West and the reputed site of the bleeding Savior’s miraculous appearance to Pope Gregory the Great during the Mass: S. Croce in Gerusalemme, in Rome. The cultic and thematic cross-associations also linked south Germany’s pilgrimage culture with the plenary indulgence once promised only to crusading knights but, after 1300, distributed also to pilgrims who visited the tombs of Peter and Paul in Rome during Jubilee years.

**Heilig Grab Surrogates: Rooted Immanence and Purgatorial Efficacy**

Every shrine has its foundation legend, or what anthropologist Victor Turner calls its “charter narrative.” In the case of Germany’s bleeding host pilgrimages, of which Passau’s is a late southern example, legends are built around spectacular transformation miracles in which the Real Presence of Christ’s suffering body is revealed in the consecrated host, both as a reproach to those inclined to infidelity or doubt, and as a prelude to their conversion or destruction. In many (but by no means in all) of these “host-miracle” legends, the Jews were enlisted to play the role of the host’s antagonists. Not until the famous case of Paris, in 1290, one generation after the institution of the Feast of Corpus Christi at Liège in 1264, did the myth of “Jewish host-

95 In the tenth-eleventh centuries Heilig-Kreuz churches built as replicas of the Holy Sepulchre were round or polygonal, while others were built on centralized cruciform plans, as examples in St. Gallen, Cologne and, later, Krakau, show; in the eleventh to twelfth centuries, Heilig Kreuz churches were built on cemeteries (Müstair, Montmajour, Bergamo); see Untermann 1989. 48. At Eichstätt, we are concerned with a small-scale replica of the Anastasis rotunda inside the Capuchin Church, which also served as a hospital church; see Reinle, 128.

96 Brooks’s summary shows the prevalence of the “burial of cross only” (Depositio Crucis) variant in a large number of texts from southern Bavaria and adjacent areas of Austria; see Neil C. Brooks, *The Sepulchre of Christ in Art and Liturgy with special reference to the Liturgic Drama* (Urbana: University of Illinois, 1921), 37. Most of these are “practically identical in responsories and rubrics and form a well-defined South Bavarian type, in which the Imago Crucifxi is buried just after communion and a stone is placed on the sepulchre (Deinde lapis supponatur)” (37; cf. also 68). This corresponds to a more fundamental practice of closing and securing the sepulchre after the objects have been deposited in it, but is noteworthy in light of Passau’s preserved “desecration stone” (Hostienstein) as a pseudo-Passion relic associated with the anti-Judaic legend.
“desecration” assume its definitive European form. Once it had, localized versions of the tale were spawned and propagated in the wake of two waves of organized anti-Jewish persecutions that swept across imperial south Germany in 1298 (the so-called Rindfleisch pogroms) and in 1336-38 (the peasant Armleder insurrection). During these periods of crusade-like fervor and political disarray, host-desecration legends operated variously as both pretext for massacre, expulsion and expropriation, and as retrospective justification for economically-motivated attacks. In roughly half the places where accusations are recorded, the social drama of persecution played out in the intertwined processes of cult-formation and shrine-building.\(^7\)

Passau’s host-desecration legend conforms to the Paris model, but appears relatively late in the history of the accusation, a dismal period in Jewish-Christian relations dominated by a spate of regional and civic expulsions and high-profile ritual murder trials in Endingen (1470), Trent (1475), and Regensburg (1476).\(^9\) Our best primary source for the affair in Passau survives


\(^9\) At least half of those accusations made their way into the sources as localized versions of the Paris miracle (whether or not they first appeared publicly in this way), and a considerable number (fourteen for south Germany and Austria) appear in relation to the foundation of a pilgrimage shrine devoted to the miraculous “bleeding host” (*Bluthostie*); see Browe, 177-8. Lotter counts thirty one host-desecration reports for south Germany and Austria before 1338 (548); of these Jews are charged with the crime in twenty-four (at least nineteen of these were played out in the region south of the Main river, nine in Austria, six in Franconia, three in Swabia and one in Bavaria). Only a handful of these “host-desecration churches” survive in anything close to their medieval form; several host-cults initiated at these places were aborted or foreclosed by authorities when their founding miracles were exposed by clerical investigators as pious frauds; at least one, Pulkau in Lower Austria, survived despite being investigated. For Pulkau, see Rubin, 65-68, and Merback, “Fount of Mercy, City of Blood.” My book in preparation, *Pilgrimage and Pogrom*, will include case studies of four host-miracle churches associated with anti-Jewish violence (Iphofen, Deggendorf, Pulkau, and Passau).

in the form of a broadsheet with the title, *Ein grawsamlich geschicht Geschehen zu passaw Von den Juden als hernach volgt* . . . (“A gruesome story which happened in Passau, concerning the Jews, as follows . . .”), printed in Nuremberg by Caspar Hochfeder in 1497 or 1498, and then reissued around 1500 by Johann Froschauer in Augsburg. 100 (fig. 18) Twelve captioned images present the spine of the narrative, which is then elaborated below in two blocks of text. In it we learn how, in 1478, a Christian servant confessed to having stolen eight hosts, and how he sold them to two Passau Jews; how in their synagogue they pierced them with a sharp knife; how the hosts miraculously gushed blood; how they attempted to conceal their crime by casting the hosts into a fiery oven; how the Jews were arrested and condemned to death; and finally how, in order to commemorate and atone for the “sins” committed against the body of Christ, a chapel was erected at the site of the crime.

Two interrelated points will here take the place of a wider analysis. First, anti-Judaic desecration tales such as this were part of a larger family of medieval host-miracle tales and, as such, operated within a horizon of expectations formed as much by them as by attitudes about Jews; second, as charter narratives they served cult-planners and their pilgrimage audiences as what I call “operative myths,” origin-narratives geared toward the specific temporal and spatial structurings of a shrine’s iconographic, architectural, and ritual program. One crucial way they did this was by furnishing the new shrine with a topographical centerpoint. Prominent in many tales is the evocation of the host’s “findspot” (*Fundort* or *Fundstelle*), the place where the host was concealed, then later elevated to a place of honor. Later legends often speak explicitly of church-building “over the findspot” (*über dem Fundort*). 101 The transformation of the site in the legend, and in perception, is powerfully expressed in *metaphors of descent and elevation*, profane burial and its reverse, resurrection. Everything else in the pilgrimage process -- cult objects, symbols, narrative imagery, and architecture -- finds its topographical and symbolic meaning precisely here: at the site of the host’s temporary sepulchre.

To serve as such topographical markers, several host-miracle churches in southern Germany and Austria incorporate floor-cavities, and in some cases feature subterranean passages, into which pilgrims could descend to collect holy earth or sand. Even in rectangular *Hallenkirchen* -- such as the fifteenth-century Holy Blood Church at Iphofen -- the legendary findspot formed the symbolic and cultic center. 102 In at least two host-miracle churches I have found, the symbolism of the find-spot received a much bolder architectural expression, one that extended to the entire church. One of these is the Chapel of the Holy Sacrament in Büren

---

100 Single-leaf woodcut, 377 x 263 mm; Munich, Staatliche Graphische Sammlung, Inv. 118307 (Schreiber 2965). For transcribed versions with extensive commentary, see Moritz Stern, “Der Passauer Judenprozeß 1478,” *Jeschurun* 15 (1929): 541-60 and 647-76; exacting summaries are found in Wurster, “Die jüdische Bevölkerung”; and idem.,“Das ende der mittelalterlichen jüdischen Gemeinde.”


102 Discussed in Merback, “Channels of Grace,” 609-11.
18. Nuremberg woodcutter, Host Desecration at Passau, woodcut broadsheet entitled, Ein grausamlich geschicht zu Passaw von den Juden ... (Nuremberg: Caspar Hochfelder, ca. 1480-90) (Munich, Staatliche Graphische Sammlung, Nr. 118307)
(Westphalia), a Baroque octagon (c. 1717) possibly reflecting its fourteenth-century precursor; the other is Passau’s Salvatorkirche. Both buildings recall the Jerusalem prototype by paraphrasing the scheme of the Anastasis rotunda in the upper sanctuary, while allowing the lower chapel -- or in the case of Büren, the Gruft, with its sacred well -- to stand symbolically for the sepulchrum domini.

In his book, Zeichensprache der Architektur, Adolf Reinle observes that “the [principal] cultic purpose of a Holy Sepulchre copy [could] be superimposed or combined with other cultic functions in one and the same structure.” That is, whether they appeared principally as a monumental shrine for relics, as a hospital-church, as a chapter house, as an ossuary, mausoleum, or as the stage for Good Friday and Easter Sunday performances -- Heilig Grab adaptations were, from a cultic standpoint, hybrid monuments, allowing for the intersection of a range of rituals. We can use this insight to reframe the question I asked at the beginning of this article: How did the dual identity of the Passau church -- pilgrimage station and monumental reliquary for the host and its secondary relics -- complement the lower chapel’s role as a mausoleum? What special benefit, if any, came to the dead buried there through the symbolic charge of the entire building? Did it matter that the building site had been the scene of a terrible sacrilege, had come under a cloud of pollution, and had been cleansed to make way for a new, resplendent cult station -- and if so, how so?

Let me suggest that the answer lies in the essential transposability of sanctity in Christian culture. In particular, we must pay attention to the potential of those forms of portable sanctity (exemplified by a relic or the host) to become their opposite, immovable sanctity, perceived as a form of salvific power, if not divine immanence, rooted in the ground at a particular place.

One example from the early history of Heilig Grab surrogates must suffice here to illustrate the rootedness of sepulchral sanctity. A circular crypt lies directly beneath the Michaelskapelle at Fulda, a circular center-room with ambulatory, built by Abbott Eigil in 818-22, just to the southwest of the monastery church, upon a cemetery. (fig. 19) This crypt was almost certainly

---

103 An eighteenth-century document describes the “newly erected chapel,” designed by the well-known architect Konrad Schlaun, as being built “upon the foundations” of the old; undated document from the Paderborn archive, quoted in Alfred Cohausz, “Vier ehemalige Sakramentswallfahrten: Gottsbüren, Hillentrup, Blomberg and Büren,” Westfälische Zeitschrift 112 (1962), 275-304, at 283.

104 Then again, if we follow Krautheimer’s lead, we know that the formal-architectural evidence need not be conclusive; in the case of the Salvatorkirche it is merely suggestive, and all the more so when taken in conjunction with the evidence of the building’s cultic and social functions (Bauaufgabe).

105 Reinle, 127, who explains that, “der kultische Zweck einer Heiliggrabkopie sich im selben Bauwerk mit anderen kultischen Funktionen verbinden oder überlagern kann.”


107 A Carolingian foundation, Fulda was dedicated in 744, by St. Boniface, as “monasterium Sancti Salvatoris”; the designation comes from the Mainzer Urkundenbuch of 756 (but no more than twenty years after its founding, in 762, we hear it already being called after its founder,
once used as an ossuary for the Benedictine monks. In the consecration text penned by Hrabanus Maurus for the chapel’s three altars, a mystical connection is established between Christ’s victory over death in the Jerusalem tomb -- the great ontological transformation of the godhead second only to the Incarnation -- and the future resurrection of those buried in the Fulda crypt: “This altar [in the crypt] is dedicated to God, in particular to Christ, whose tomb stands by our graves.” Referring evidently to the entire chapel, which reproduced key elements of the Jerusalem prototype, thereby sharing in its immanence, this formula invites the perception that the Lord’s tomb -- present here in effigie -- magically aided the souls of those buried nearby it. In its salvific potency the Michaelskapelle appears to be consubstantial with its prototype.

Another way to view this phenomenon is as a variation on the ancient tradition of burial ad sanctos, internment in proximity to the body of the saint, whose purified remains expressed the promise of resurrection and transformed the cemetery into a locus sanctus. Immediately it becomes clear how this applies to the Salvatorkirche and its related sites. At the host-miracle churches, the originary source of immanence is not the incorruptible remains of the martyr, but

---

108 See Kroesen, 16. Untermann, however, argues that the contemporary reports do not allow for the conclusion, widespread in the scholarly literature, that the lower level served as an ossuary for secondary burials; it is missing from the report of Brun of Candidus (840) as well as the tenth-century Gesta abbatum, which designates the Michaelskapelle only as an aecclesia in cymiterio, and follows Brun in relating the symbolism of the middle support and the keystone of the vaults; see Untermann, 57-58. Instead, the sources apparently refer to the donation by Abbott Hrabanus of a copy of the Ark of the Covenant!

109 Quoted in Kroesen, 16, who believes the text refers to a copy of the aedicule in Jerusalem, approximately 3.5 meters in diameter, placed in the center of the chapel; Untermann is highly dubious of any claim that the Hrabanus text (Hoc altare Deo dedicatum est maxime Christo / cuius hic tumulus nostra sepulchra iuvat . . . ), written for the consecration of the chapel’s three altars, actually refers to a centrally-placed, small-format Heilig Grab replica; rather, he argues that, with the word tumulus, Hrabanus, like Abbott Eigil, is referring to the entire chapel (Untermann 57-58), itself a rotunda with ambulatory, reproducing important elements of the Jerusalem prototype.

110 Untermann’s conclusion supports my own: “Das Zitat der Heiligen Stätte wurde in Fulda für die traditionelle Bauaufgabe der klösterlichen Begräbniskirche dienstbar gemacht und verlieh dem Bau eine besondere Heilwirksamkeit” (58).

19. Interior of rotunda, Church of St. Michael (begun c. 818-22), Fulda
(Source: Bernhard Schütz and Wolfgang Müller, *Deutsche Romanik: Die Kirchenbauten der Kaiser, Bischöfe und Klöster* [Freiburg im Breisgau: Herder, 1989], pl. 20 [changed into black and white]).
the bleeding, historical body of Christ himself. Exquisitely vulnerable for what it is (fragile bread) and what it embodies (suffering flesh), the transformed host in German religious culture exemplified the inherent power of portable sanctity to become transposed into earthbound forms at particular places.

To see this principle in action, we may consider (again, only briefly) one further site, the former Cistercian convent and pilgrimage chapel at Heiligengrabe, in Brandenburg, founded in 1287 by the Markgraf Otto V of the house of Askanier. In 1521 the Rostock printer Ludwig Dietz published the cloister’s foundation legend with fifteen woodcuts narrating the following tale: in 1285 (or 1287) a Jewish merchant from Freiburg (on the Elbe) stole a consecrated host from the village church in nearby Techow, (fig. 20) but when, inexplicably, his contraband became too ponderous, and he could transport it no farther, he buried it under a gallows in the vicinity of the future shrine; soon betrayed by blood traces on his hands, the Jew was caught, condemned, and executed.112 Appearing two centuries after the first documented chapel on the site (1317), Dietz’s edition was timed to coincide with the pilgrimage chapel’s Gothic remodeling (consecrated on May 23, 1512). Turn quickly to our own time. In the mid-1980s archaeologists found a small, vaulted stone “sepulchre” at the geometric center of the earliest chapel on the site and, arrayed around it, eight interred skeletons.113 (fig. 21) Barring a more detailed presentation, we may ask: Did an early, undocumented version of the legend form the basis for the creation and disposition of the mausoleum’s dominant symbol? Far more likely the opposite is the case; that the legend arose in retrospective allusion to an established focal point in the nave, which probably served as an Easter sepulchre, attracting donations and adjacent burials over the chapel’s history. That the church may have in fact been originally built over an


113 Six of these burials are monastic while two, beneath the foundations of the first chapel and therefore predating it, may actually be executed criminals interred under a gallows! See Faensen, 242, whose analysis is based on the work of Christa and Friedrich Plate, “Die Ergebnisse der Ausgrabungen in der Wunderblutkapelle des Klosters Heiligengrabe, Kr. Wittstock. Vorbericht,” Ausgrabungen und Funde: Archäologische Berichte und Informationen 32 (1987): 94-99.
execution grounds (Richtstätt) and its cemetery complicates this reading somewhat, but it also reinforces what has already been said about the sanctifying, cleansing power of eucharistic immanence (the anti-Jewish component in the legend, by contrast, appears to be secondary). Here, then, is a complex example of how sanctity becomes rooted in the soil through the temporary presence of a transformed host, and how a eucharistic miracle legend might take its cue from emerging forms of burial practice -- or, conversely, inspire them. Essential through all of this is the legend’s capacity to produce the topographic specificity required for cult.

Gustaf Dalman, the foremost student of Germany’s Holy Sepulchre simulations, endorsed the idea of a magical efficacy rooted in the bounded zones of immovable sanctity associated with such monuments. Burial at or near the site where Jesus’s death and resurrection took place would, he wrote, "ensure their [the dead] having a share in salvation and resurrection. A magical effect in this cannot be ruled out." Dalman was undoubtedly using the term magical effect (magische Wirkung) rather loosely, at least, with none of the critical rigor applied by anthropologists after the work of Mary Douglas. But the essential notion retains its validity, I believe, when we focus the concept around a defining feature of mortuary beliefs in the Middle Ages, namely, that the penitential passage of souls through purgatory could be hastened by both spiritual and material forces. For it was not only the spiritual will marshaled on behalf of the dead that speeded their passage; the material matrix of the burial station could also confer its own benefits. At cemeteries such as the Campo Santo in Pisa, part of the Campo dei Miracoli (Field of Wonders), sacred earth was imported from Palestine because, among other properties, it was believed capable of hastening decomposition by magically stripping flesh from bone. Testators who could not be buried at the church of les Saints-Innocents in Paris, the most famous of these medieval cemeteries -- it was nicknamed the “flesh-eater” in light of its reputation for consuming a body within twenty-four hours -- requested in their wills that portions of its soil be placed in their graves. Like cemeteries sanctified by the presence of a saint’s relics in earlier centuries, burial stations graced in the later Middle Ages by the presence of a Holy Sepulchre replica, or even a prominent Easter sepulchre, could be perceived in quasi-magical terms. “Burial apud ecclesiam

114 This supposition needs more attention than I can give it here. Philippe Ariès notes that canon law made the transformation of an existing cemetery into a church problematic, citing one ruling that stated, “If bodies have been buried before the church has been consecrated, let it not be consecrated”; discussed in The Hour of Our Death, trans. Helen Weaver (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1981), 51.

115 “Die Stätte des Abschlusses des heilbringenden Ganges Jesu in den Tod und seiner Auferstehung würde ihnen die Teilnahme am Heil und an der Totenerweckung sichern. Eine magische Wirkung mag dabei nicht ausgeschlossen sein”; see D. Gustaf Dalman, Das Grab Christi in Deutschland, Studien über christliche Denkmäler, ed. Johannes Ficker, Heft 14 (Leipzig: Dieterich, 1922), 26. Kroesen echoes the idea, arguing that returning pilgrims (and others?) “believed that the miraculous power of the original tomb was transferred to a consecrated Holy Sepulchre in Western Europe . . .” (13).

116 Ariès, 58, 360, who summarizes the evidence from fifteenth-century wills; see also Nancy Caciola, “Wraiths, Revenants and Ritual in Medieval Culture,” Past and Present 152 (Aug. 1996): 3-45, who sees the practice of adding handfuls of soil from Les Innocents during funerals as one among several methods for checking the post-mortem activities of corpses (33).
had replaced burial ad sanctos,” explains Philippe Ariès, it was no longer “the confession of the saint” that served as the privileged site of burial, “but the table of eucharistic sacrifice” -- the site of the “daily miracle” of the Mass, the consecrated church itself.¹¹⁷

Unlike other sites where central-crypts invited associations with the sepulcrum domini, at the Salvatorkirche it was the presence, proclaimed by legend, of Christ’s historical body, mutilated and bleeding and magicalized in the tomb, that imparted to the place its special form of sanctity. In the perceptions structured by the legend, the originating metaphors of upward movement from the tomb -- the martyred host’s recovery and elevation -- set the pattern for architecture, wherein Christ’s vindication blazes a path of glorious ascent through sacred space. To map this originating upward movement, to enshrine it as a zone of post-mortem spiritual progress, the architect organized the edifice around a vertical axis connecting the church’s upper and lower zones. Liberated souls -- the grateful dead buried in the church, future intercessors for all who assisted them -- could therefore be visualized by the penitential pilgrim as moving upward along this invisible “channel of grace.” Around this organizing center everything else acquires (what Victor Turner calls) “positional” meanings. Having deposited its immanence in the ground, making the Salvatorkirche a new kind of locus sanctus and an efficacious site of prayer and post-mortem redemption, the bleeding host might itself remain on hand as a holy relic to be venerated as the shrine’s dominant symbol, as happened elsewhere, or it could be forced to relinquish this preeminent role to another, less controversial cult object or work of devotionalia, such as an altarpiece.¹¹⁸

And what of the vanquished synagogue? The question of how its memory pervaded the cult environment and its rituals requires a separate investigation. But it is worth noting that, in cases where churches were built upon the ruins of synagogue, the projected presence of the risen Host seems to have been a factor in advancing the cause of Christian purification in the local emplacement and beyond. The Passau affair transpired during a pivotal historical period, 1470-1520, a time when German-speaking lands witnessed a tremendous upsurge in pilgrimage activity and also, not coincidentally, a sense of crisis in the face of the Turkish menace to the east, and the perception of a Jewish threat (allied with “judaizing” heresies), undermining Christendom from within.¹¹⁹ Pilgrimage culture in this period gave activist expression to a form of corporate piety that was deeply anxious about pollution, and zealously eager to see sanctity progressively revealed across an expanding sacred landscape. Purifying and, in a sense, liberating sacred space from infidel “occupation” entailed, my analysis suggests, a certain commitment to immovable forms of sanctity. Liberation of the dead, and the consolidation of loyalty networks based on collective penitential prayer, ran parallel to this commitment. Gripped by a crusade-like fervor, the burgeoning culture of pilgrimage in south Germany lent a new intensity to the corporate imperative toward penitential prayer and the earning of indulgences for both kin and non-kin dead. The pilgrimage church of Sankt Salvator in Passau could offer itself as a place where, through their prayers for the dead, pilgrims participated in those larger networks of loyalty that underwrote, at the grassroots level, the theocratic principles of the prince-bishopric in the German empire.¹²⁰

¹¹⁷ Ariès, 72.

¹¹⁸ Discussed in Merback, “Channels of Grace,” 625-30; a detailed account of a wonderhost ultimately displaced by an altarpiece is presented in idem, “Fount of Mercy, City of Blood.”

¹¹⁹ Discussed in ibid.


---

I am extending to the host-miracle shrines Lionel Rothkrug’s brilliant and complex analysis of “earthbound holiness” and its relationship to political loyalties in the south German prince-bishoprics: “By identifying every shrine, every saint, and every holy image with a locus sanctus, the Reichskirche transformed every ecclesiastical territory into a holy land and made every pilgrimage vow an oath of allegiance.” See Rothkrug, “German Holiness,” 172; and my remarks in “Channels of Grace,” 590-94.


Ludwig Heinrich Krick, _Alte Inschriften an den Gebäuden der Stadt Passau und deren nächster Umgegend_ (Passau: Waldbauer, 1925).


Late Medieval Pilgrimage Architecture in Northern Europe, c.1250-1520: A Summary of Recent Research and New Perspectives

By Vibeke Olsen

In a recent study on altarpieces and devotion, Beth Williamson began her article by stating that, “In recent years medievalists in many disciplines have been considering the culture of religious observance as a physical and spatial phenomenon, as well as an intellectual, devotional and visual one. The architecture of the medieval church is now likely to be considered as a matrix of sacred space, and of liturgical and devotional action, rather than simply as a designed object, to be fitted in somewhere on a developmental scale from Romanesque to Renaissance.”

To my mind, this statement sums up not only the ideas presented in the 2004 Society of Architectural Historians session, Late Medieval Pilgrimage Architecture in Northern Europe, c.1250-1520: New Perspectives (and in this issue of Peregrinations), but the current trend in scholarship on medieval architecture in general. The formal interpretation of a structure has its limitations. If the totality of a space is to be fully understood, it must be considered as a Gesamtkunstwerk – with several, if not all, of the varied aspects of the building taken into consideration, including form, function, liturgy, movement, decoration, and furnishings.

The evolving historiography of medieval architecture, particularly pilgrimage architecture, is an interesting and telling one (and, surprisingly, one often distinct from the scholarship on pilgrimage in general). Arthur Kingsley Porter, for instance, long ago identified for us the formal characteristics and trends in a specific set of pilgrimage-type buildings. Richard Krautheimer then showed us that architecture can have meaning, specifically as a copy, however broadly one wishes to define the term. More recently, the essays published in Artistic Integration in Gothic

---


Buildings, though somewhat outside the scope of pilgrimage architecture per se, revealed the importance of studying the building from various perspectives and as an interactive and multifaceted space. Other studies have considered specific furnishings and functional aspects which affect the dynamic of the architectural space, such as the addition of choir screens, the display of relics and specific liturgical needs. Finally, the three papers by Mitchell Merback, Gerhard Weilandt, and Andreas Förderer presented at both the SAH session and in this issue of Peregrinations have continued and expanded upon this trend by examining buildings in terms of their form, as assimilated copies, as functional and functioning spaces, and to some degree as centers of economic activity. By focusing on later northern shrines, these papers show that pilgrimage was a viable and thriving industry outside the traditionally established canon of pilgrimage centers, such as Rome, Canterbury and the shrines of the Camino de Santiago.

In his discussion of the pilgrimage church of St. Salvator, Merback takes Krautheimer’s idea of the iconography of a building to the next level by considering several important symbolic functions of the building – as a copy, as a political statement, and as an anagogically divided space through which movement is, to some degree, choreographed. As a copy of the Holy Sepulchre, the mortuary aspect of the building is symbolically described; thus, its symbolism supports its function. Of equal importance was the situation of the structure over the former synagogue, again creating a symbolic (and political) link between past and present which also reinforces yet another function of the building – that of a shrine for a bleeding host. This link appears to be further reinforced by the specific use of a six-pointed Star of David vault over the space.

Förderer’s essay on the church of Saint-Nicolas-de-Port is also particularly interesting in its investigation of the function of a space which is not necessarily contingent on its form. Nevertheless, the divergent function and form were integral parts of the structure. In this case, the building serves as both a clerical and pilgrimage space, though it utilizes the symbolic form of a cathedral. The church was intended as a pilgrimage church, but designed for political and economic purposes to look like a cathedral. This was a brilliant idea, as the economic ramifications of pilgrimage were central to the existence of both a shrine and a town, ergo the wealthier it appeared, the more important the shrine and the more money it brought in. The significance of movement within the space is also vital to our understanding of that space. In Förderer’s example, he considers not only movement, but the furnishings as well. Furnishings, as

---


much as the physical constraints of a given space, define movement and, by extension, the function of the space.

The evidence for the importance of movement and liturgical furnishings to the function of space and devotion can be clearly seen in the reading of pilgrims’ accounts of their own experiences within a given space. In one of the earliest of these accounts, the Pilgrimage of Egeria, c.381-384, she describes the specific movements which take place during the Liturgy of Jerusalem at the Holy Sepulchre. She writes:

Now at the tenth hour [vespers] ... all the people assemble at the Anastasis ... and all the candles and tapers are lit. Now the light is not introduced from without, but it is brought forth from within the cave, that is from within the rails. ... Afterwards the bishop is conducted from the Anastasis to the Cross [with] hymns. ... Thereupon both the bishop and the whole multitude further proceed behind the Cross, where all that was done before the Cross is repeated, and [the people] approach the hand of the bishop behind the Cross as they did at the Anastasis and before the Cross. Moreover, there are hanging everywhere a vast number of great glass chandeliers, and there are also a vast number of cereofala, before the Anastasis, before the Cross and behind the Cross, for the whole does not end until darkness has set in.\(^6\)

In Egeria’s description we see the significance, to an eye-witness participant, of the movement between two entirely distinct spaces, the Anastasis and, presumably, the courtyard where the cross was displayed. In this description, we find repeated movements which are performed at specific symbolic locations, such as the tomb and the cross. It also reinforces the importance of some of the furnishings which defined that movement – the cave, the railings, the cross itself, and even the lighting. Physical movement and its interactions with liturgical space and furnishings, therefore, have been a defining element in Christian pilgrimage architecture from its very inception. Specific things happen in specific places for specific reasons.\(^7\)

Along this line, Förderer brings up another important and often-overlooked point, the transept arm as a unique space, separate in function from the rest of the building. In this case, the transept acts as an entrance and ambulatory to aid in the circulation of pilgrims to and from the

---


\(^7\) This emphasis on defining movement in the totality of a space is succinctly summarized by Parker who sees, “... the architecture of a church, its furnishings and decoration, as a vibrant vehicle for the processional journey in sacred time through sacred space, a solemn pilgrimage, the goal of which is the eucharistic celebration at the altar ...” “Architecture as Liturgical Setting,” 274-275.
relic altar. Not nearly enough scholarly attention has been paid to the space of the transept and its complicated relationship to the rest of the structure.

Form and, more specifically, function, are also a focus of Weilandt’s paper on the pilgrimage shrines of Nuremberg. In this paper, two vastly different spaces are considered, one designed for the public the other private, both with a distinct separation of space based on function – liturgical and devotional (or clerical and lay). Furnishings, ranging from the impermanent (wooden stalls, candlesticks, and tapestries) to the permanent (balustrades and grilles) are again shown to be an integral feature in the delineation of space, and presumably of motion as well. He has also shown that at St. Sebald, the transept once again plays an important role in the characterization of space and the definition of movement. Its portals act as the point of entrance to the building and access to the relic shrine via the ambulatory which was marked with imagery (in the form of stained glass, paintings, and sculpture) that further defined both the function of and behavior in that space.

The reception of images is another critical area of inquiry for pilgrimage studies. For instance, how was the decoration of a building received? Who were the spectators, and what might the decoration have meant to them? In some cases, such as at St. Sebald, images functioned in direct relation with a specific space. They can also work as a visual link between building and spectator, communicating to the spectator the function of the building. Images were, for the most part, designed to be seen, and as such, play an integral role in the spectator’s experience of a space. Images communicate, they were intended to be read, and they cannot be divorced from the spaces they inhabit.

Another important area of consideration which has been addressed to some degree in two of the papers (Weilandt and Förderer), is the economics of pilgrimage. Although the association between the two has been debated, it appears to me, again based on primary sources, that medieval pilgrimage and economics were closely related. For instance, in his text on pilgrimage, Sumption makes reference to a parish priest of Bollezeel in Flanders who mentioned to a visiting pilgrim that, “all this [meaning the church] was paid out of the offerings of pilgrims who appeared in droves, receiving consolation from our Blessed Lady and buying badges at the door.” Monies from pilgrims, in the form of alms or purchases of indulgences and/or pilgrim

---


9 In my own work, I have looked at the reception of marginal imagery on the west portal of Chartres and its role in visually communicating the multi-functional aspect of the building – cathedral, cathedral school and place of pilgrimage. See, “Engaging the Spectator: Nature as Catalyst in the Royal Portal of Chartres,” in *Arte y Ciencia XXIV Coloquio Internacional de Historia del Arte*, ed. P. Krieger (Mexico, 2002): 531-548, and forthcoming, “Through the Eyes of the King, the Count, the Cleric and the Pilgrim: Meaning in the Margins and the Reception of the West Portal of Chartres.”


souvenirs were an important source of income which contributed to the construction of shrines. Not only was money from pilgrimage important for the financial support of a given church, but also for the town, as discussed by Weilandt in the story of the stone at the tomb of St. Sebald – an obvious reminder to the pious to purchase a very large cheese in the market on their way to the church, thereby directly supporting the town’s economy.\textsuperscript{12}

Economics, the reception of images and space, the function of space and its furnishings, as well as politics, history and liturgy, are all critical facets in our understanding of pilgrimage architecture as functioning spaces. The papers presented in this issue have given us much to consider, and I believe will lead not only to some stimulating discussion, but hopefully to a more integrated approach to the topic of pilgrimage architecture as a whole. As we have seen in this brief summary, the study of medieval pilgrimage architecture, whether early or late, northern or southern, local, regional, or distant, can be highly multifaceted when consideration is broadened beyond the simple, formal characteristics of a building and placed within a larger context. In our approach to the study of medieval pilgrimage architecture, we have traveled our own distinct journey in which we have gone from the formal identification of building types and regional styles (Porter), to the iconographic in terms of the building as a bearer of meaning (Krautheimer and Bandmann), to the integrative or interdisciplinary which examines the building as a complex and multi-functional space, as we find with the papers presented in this issue of \textit{Peregrinations}. This journey has ultimately led us to the question with which I would like conclude: what is the next logical step in our investigation of medieval pilgrimage architecture, and where might it eventually lead us?\endnote{12}

\endnote{12} The relationship of pilgrimage, architecture, and economics continues still to this day, as evidenced by the many weary pilgrims seeking enlightenment at conferences, such as the one in Providence, contributing to the local economy by way of food, drink and lodging, and purchasing their badges at the door.
In the course of the year 1998, two junior researchers at the Radboud University of Nijmegen (The Netherlands) started work on a database of medieval pilgrimage souvenirs and profane badges. Their goal was simple: to make the highly scattered material accessible to researchers and interested laymen. The database could serve also as an instrument of documentation for these fragile objects which are inevitably subject to corrosion and damage. The vulnerability of the material becomes alarmingly apparent when one compares the nineteenth-century drawings of badges with the actual objects in the Musée du Moyen-Age in Paris. (Fig. 1) Arthur Forgeais who directed the dredging operations of the Seine (beginning in 1848), was fascinated by the numerous finds of small metal objects that emerged from the riverbed. Fortunately, he decided to publish these finds, and soon after, a large portion of these metal finds came into the possession of the Musée du Moyen Age in Paris. In 1996, the museum published a catalogue of the Enseignes de pèlerinage et enseignes profanes in the collection. One can immediately see the deteriorating effects of oxygen on the objects since their initial discovery almost 150 years before. Oxidation causes the objects to crumble and metal fatigue causes clips and pins to break off. Clearly, documentation of these fragile pieces is vital for the preservation of detail. Now that the scholarly world has begun to realize the value of badges as a source of information on late-medieval life, the creation of a database is no luxury.

The idea for the database originated with Radboud University professor Jos Koldeweij, a renowned and widely-published expert on pilgrim’s souvenirs and secular badges. Under his

---

121 Arthur Forgeais (1862-66). Collection de plombs historiés trouvés dans la Seine. 6 Vols. Paris, Aubry, especially parts II (Enseignes de pèlerinage) and IV (Imagerie religieuse) which focus on the badges.
supervision, two art historians started to work on an inventory of badges. They collected literature and brought the objects together in a database that was developed especially to fit the needs of the project: an instrument that focused on archaeological objects from an scientific point of view. In the database, every badge is complemented with the relevant scholarly literature so that the visitor to the database can easily retrieve and check the information first hand. Furthermore, every object is provided with an iconographical description and iconclass codes, allowing the visitor to search for elements within each depiction. Finally, there is room for an image as well because a verbatim description can never replace a picture.

The project was christened Kunera. At the time, the university was still called the Katholieke Universiteit Nijmegen – in 2004, the name was changed to Radboud University – and its initials supplied the first part of the name: KUN. Kunera was an obvious choice. Cunera, or Kunera in Middle Dutch, was highly-venerated saint in the Netherlands during the Middle Ages. During her life, Cunera joined the retinue of the 11,000 virgins who journeyed with St. Ursula on her pilgrimage to Rome. On the way back, the pilgrims stopped at the harbour of Cologne. There, they were attacked by the Huns who had besieged the port. Unlike many others, Cunera survived the massacre. A king called Radboud – his name can hardly be accidental – hid her underneath the fabric of his cloak and carried her off to his residence in Rhenen, situated between Nijmegen and Utrecht. Cunera was ultimately martyred when, because of the attention of the king, she made the queen envious of her position at the court. All the badges from Rhenen that have been found so far show Cunera being strangled. (Fig. 2) The cloth used to strangle her occupied an important position in the ceremonies at the church of Rhenen, mainly as a cure for throat diseases, and, as such it occupies central place in the pilgrim badge. The fabric is wrapped around Cunera’s neck with the queen holding one end, and a servant, the other. Cunera hardly seems affected as she stands upright with her hands folded in prayer.

Crowds of pilgrims attracted craftsmen to the area of Rhenen and to many other pilgrimage sites. Metalworkers, including gold- and silversmiths, produced pilgrimage souvenirs to sell to the pilgrims who flocked there. The database Kunera focuses on the metal badges and ampullae, mainly of pewter, that were produced in Europe and the Near East from the twelfth century onwards, peaking in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. The stamped medals that came into use during the fifteenth century are included. After the sixteenth century, badges, for the most part, fell into disuse. The cheap mass-produced badges were replaced by double-sided pendants and single-leaf prints. In some places, the tradition of badges was continued. In Sankt Wolfgang am Abersee, for example, badges were produced until well into the eighteenth century. These are exceptions to the rule, however; so that the database has an obvious final date of 1600 (or 1599 according to Kunera’s methods).

From the foregoing, it may look like the database is limited to pilgrimage souvenirs. This is certainly not the case. Religious badges do not always come from a site of pilgrimage. Because of their immense popularity, saints like Christopher, Catherine and Barbara, were venerated by many. Their cult was not limited to one site. Badges of these saints met the needs of a wide public and were produced at many different locations. Not all badges featured religious iconography, many depicted a wide variety of profane subjects. Some have literary sources, like the tale of Reynaert the Fox, while others depict objects of everyday life or parody the society of the day. When categorizing the badges, the religious and the profane cannot always be separated. In the Middle Ages, there was a fine line between the sacred and the secular that cannot not always be discerned by the present-day viewer. The distinction was probably not always relevant to the men and women in the Middle Ages. The secular badges comment on religious life, and religious

---

badges sometimes include profane elements. The profane and religious badges complement each other. They should not be separated. Therefore, Kunera includes both.

Since its initial stages, Kunera has come a long way. After first entering objects from large (published) collections, the focus shifted to unpublished objects and obscure articles. Currently, Kunera contains the descriptions of over 10,000 objects in private and public collections all over Europe and the United States. The database mainly contains information on original objects (8500 entries and counting). Other material sources complement the core of original badges: moulds (58 entries), cast badges on bells, baptismal fonts and pewter cans (902 entries), painted badges on paintings, in prints and manuscripts (383 entries). Now all of the entries are on line. They can be viewed at www.ru.nl/ckd/kunera. Because the work on the database continues and new finds – both archaeological and scholarly – occur constantly, Kunera is updated regularly.

Kunera on-line is probably best illustrated with an example of an entry. (Fig. 3) Whenever available, the described object is provided with an image. (Fig. 2) The textual fields include further details like a description (in Dutch and in English), iconclass codes (an iconographic classification system), the inscription, its method of attachment, measurements (in centimeters), materials, land and place of origin, and the archaeological site where the object was found. The ‘source’ field indicates the nature of the described object: whether the depicted badge is an original, a mould, a cast, or a reproduction. In the case at hand, the description of the Kunera badge in the Museum Het Valkhof, the fields medium, artist, measurements, technique and material are not filled in. Only when the described object is a visual source or a cast badge, is such data applicable. Thereafter, what follows is a general dating with a reference. The bibliography and the present whereabouts of the object are listed below. The cited literature concerns the badge at hand, and these references offer the visitor the possibility of checking the data on the screen. At the same time, it assists in the search for further reading. Through the bibliography, the visitor gains an clear insight into the literature on the subject of medieval badges and ampullae.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Object</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inventory-number</td>
<td>08102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Kunera between two women who are strangling her with a piece of cloth, each standing under a different arch of the gothic arcade that is framing them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iconclasscode</td>
<td>11HH(CUNERA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iconclasscode</td>
<td>31E2354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inscription</td>
<td>(S)NUTE KUNERA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attachment</td>
<td>Eyes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measures</td>
<td>6,4 x 4,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Material</td>
<td>Pewter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land of origin</td>
<td>Nederland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Place of origin</td>
<td>Rhenen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source</td>
<td>Original</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig. 3: Entry on the badge from Rhenen. Description from www.ru.nl/ckd/kunera.

Kunera still has a long way to go. For two more years, the Netherlands Organisation of Scientific Research (NWO) will support the database project financially. After that, its preservation is guaranteed, because Kunera is part of the Center of Art-historical Documentation (CKD) of the Radboud University that manages several databases on different subjects. Ideally, however, Kunera will raise new funds to ensure a continuation of the work. Even with 10,000 entries, the contents in the database form only a part of all the badges in private and public collections. Especially in the private collections, there are many badges which have not yet been documented. Kunera therefore makes no claim to be exhaustive, but it does aim to at least to include as many Dutch and Belgian finds as possible. Fortunately, the research of the Dutch and Belgian material is well under way and publications on the subject are manifold. Nonetheless, a lot of work still needs to be done. There are some practical problems to solve as well. The on-line version of Kunera is still in its infancy and one can detect some shortcomings. At the moment, the database offers the possibility of browsing different categories or entering query words in one single search field. Hopefully, a specialized search with multiple search fields will be an option in the future. Despite its faults, Kunera provides an impressive body of data that is accessible to researchers and others. Because of the combination of badges, material sources and references,

---

127 Most impressive is the work of H.J.E. van Beuningen and A.M. Koldeweij, in Heilig en profaan. I: 1.000 laat-middeleeuwse insignes uit de collectie H.J.E. van Beuningen (Cothen: Stichting Middeleeuwse Religieuze en Profane Insignes, 1993) and Heilig en profaan. II: 1200 laatmiddeleeuwse insignes uit openbare en particuliere collecties (Cothen: Stichting Middeleeuwse Religieuze en Profane Insignes, 2001) with a third volume on the way.
the database offers a unique tool for further study. Its makers are hopeful that Kunera will prove to be a helpful instrument in the field of medieval pilgrimage.
Blogging the Medieval Revolution?
By Sarah Blick

Blogs (short for “web logs”) are a new phenomenon. At their most basic, blogs are websites that feature a running commentary on whatever interests the “blogger”; thus the majority of blogs are personal diaries that usually only interest the blogger’s friends and family. But the most popular blogs interest hundreds of thousands of people who visit their site each day. These blogs have had a tremendous impact on news, media, and politics. The findings and commentaries of these blogs have raised huge amounts of money for presidential candidates, forced the resignation of news executives, politicians, and helped bring information about major political movements in places like Krygyzstan ([http://www.registan.net/?p=4848](http://www.registan.net/?p=4848)) and Africa ([http://www.blogafrica.org/](http://www.blogafrica.org/)) to a wider audience. Bloggers link to articles from newspapers all over the world and some of the bigger blogs even “dispatch” their own correspondents. That is, when they want news and information from say, Kazakhstan, they connect with a Kazak blogger and post photos, commentary, etc. Bloggers now post news from every country in the world, except perhaps, North Korea, which restricts internet access. ([http://www.nkzone.org/nkzone/Blogs](http://www.nkzone.org/nkzone/Blogs)). The “blogosphere” takes to task politicians, the MSM or “mainstream media,” academia, and more. Whatever your political bent you will find blogs that inspire you or infuriate you. Here are links to some of the biggest political blogs in the U.S.:

http://www.dailykos.com/ (left)  http://instapundit.com/ (right)

http://www.liberaloasis.com/ (left)  http://littlegreenfootballs.com/weblg/ (right)

But blogs go beyond politics. Indeed, with over 24,000 blogs being created every day, you can find a blog on every topic under the sun: medicine, law, education, gardening, recipes, cats (and dogs), history – there’s even a blog on academic copyright! For example:

http://blogcatalog.com/directory/personal/health/medicine/ (medicine)
http://www.projo.com/blogs/shenews/gardenblogs.htm (gardening)
http://pajamapundits.powerblogs.com/posts/1111756861.shtml (recipes)
Reading through some of these blogs (when I ought to have been grading exams or cleaning the house), I began to wonder whether there were blogs on art-historical or medieval, Renaissance, and early modern topics. Naturally, there are. Unfortunately, while lots of medievalists have blogs, many tend to be the “I went to the grocery store” type with some medieval thoughts thrown in. Still, every movement has to start somewhere. Here are some active blogs written by medievalists:

http://www.artsjournal.com/
http://www.blogenspiel.blogspot.com/
http://www.earlymodernweb.org.uk/emn/
http://fishpond.owlfish.com/medievallogs.html
http://community.itergateway.org/
http://www.livejournal.com/userinfo.bml?user=middle_ages
http://homepage.mac.com/gillgren/iblog/B1104942885/ (Renaissance)

Here are three that roundup and report almost daily on new archaeological and art historical discoveries:

http://www.cronaca.com/
http://www.mirabilis.ca/
http://pecia.tooblog.fr

How will blogs influence the study of medieval art history? With blogs making a big splash in most fields, it is probably only a matter of time before they influence our field as well. Will they play a role in expanding the discourse between scholars or just become fun time-wasters; it’s too soon to tell.
Wealth of medieval Hebrew manuscripts uncovered in Spain

Stuffed inside the covers of books, at the Provincial Historic Archive of the northeastern town of Girona, Spain, are what may be the largest collection of ancient Hebrew manuscripts in Europe. The first manuscript fragment was found several years ago but archive personnel thought it was a one-time discovery; but recent investigative work unveiled up to a thousand document fragments hidden in the covers of books and the archive believes there could be many more.

The fragments studied and restored so far included texts from the Book of Genesis and the Torah as well as marriage and business contracts. Girona was one of the most important Jewish population centers in Spain prior to the expulsion of all non-Catholics in 1492 by the Catholic kings Isabel and Ferdinand. Matas believes the town once had some 700 Jews. The Hebrew documents are most likely remnants of what Jewish families left behind them when they fled. The archive has restored the fragments found in five books and plans to leave the rest in the book covers. The archive is currently looking for financial support to recuperate all the texts. It plans to stage an exposition detailing the discovery in October.

--Story condensed from an Associated Press report, March 20, 2003

An Armrest for Charlemagne

When an engraved stone was found in 1911 on a building site, it didn't excite many. But now Mechthild Schulze-Darrlamm, an archeologist at the Roman-Germanic Museum in Mainz, has determined that it's actually part of Germany's oldest throne, sat in by Emperor Charlemagne. The piece was catalogued, briefly described and promptly put away to gather dust in a museum storeroom. After seeing the engravings on the piece, she realized she had more than a medieval signpost on her hands. Further research and comparisons with other royal artifacts showed that the object supported the royal arm in the year 790 at the latest, making it older than the marble throne in Aachen which dates from around 800.

http://www.dw-world.de
15th-Century Tunnel Re-Opened at Canterbury Cathedral

A 15th-Century tunnel at Canterbury Cathedral which allows pilgrims to visit the site of the murder of Thomas Becket has been reopened to the public. Built around 1420, it allowed pilgrims to go under the pulpitum (which feature the steps to the choir) to visit the site of the Martyrdom without disturbing the monks performing their daily duties.

It links the southwest transept to the northwest transept where Becket was killed. For the last 40 years, it was closed off for storage. The Cathedral’s official website notes, that The Very Reverend Robert Willis, Dean of Canterbury, said the tunnel would give proper access to people in wheelchairs to the Martyrdom - one of the most important parts of the Cathedral. “The Cathedral has hundreds of steps which can make life difficult for anyone who finds it hard to climb up and down steps,” he said. “Now it has been cleared and reopened, it also gives tantalizing new vistas of two central areas of the Cathedral.”

http://www.canterbury-cathedral.org/

New Scholarly Society

The Society for Popular Culture and the Middle Ages (PCMA) was co-founded in the fall of 2004 by Carl James Grindley and Michael A. Torregrossa. The goals of PCMA are to encourage and promote scholarship dealing with topics traditionally seen as being “low brow” and attempt to bring such studies into the mainstream. The Society merges and incorporates the various sites and
discussion lists formerly part of the Society for Arthurian Popular Culture Studies, which was founded by Torregrossa in March 2003 to foster research on Arthurian popular culture from all periods in which representations of the Arthurian legend appear.
http://home.att.net/~mtorregrossa/index.htm
International Study Centre for the History of Cities
http://www.storiadellacitta.it

Alessandro Camiz, Ph.D. candidate in History of Cities, University of Rome “La Sapienza”

The internet site of the International Study Centre for the History of Cities, directed by Enrico Guidoni, online since 2001, collects information and records scientific research on the History of Cities and Territory in Italy with a particular focus on the Middle Ages. The site is published in Italian, though a general translation in English is scheduled to appear in late 2005. The name of the site reflects the publication, *Storia della Città*, Electa editrice, founded and directed by Enrico Guidoni in 1976 and the Ph.D. program in *History of cities* (Dottorato di Ricerca in Storia della Città, Dipartimento di Architettura e Analisi della Città, Università degli studi di Roma “La Sapienza”), which has been active since 1995 and is coordinated by Prof. Enrico Guidoni.

The site is designed for scholars and researchers. It shows an internationally-known method of scientific research that has experimented (within the Faculty of Architecture “Valle Giulia”) with new methods in understanding the history of human settlements within a wide open, interdisciplinary approach. These research methods of research, rooted in a decennial tradition, do not adhere to a particular vision of the History of Cities as a General History (political, economical and social). Rather, the central focus concerns the material transformations of cities and the history of urban design considered together with the history of architectural and artistic design. The belief that each document has to be localized in a precise space and time to be correctly understood is the starting point for an innovative interpretation of the urban organism and its form. Only if applied to spatial, environmental, artistic and archaeological domains, can
- Historical Centres. This section hosts proposals useful for the preservation of landscapes, historical centres, historical environments, and all the portions of our territories that are potential victims due to a misunderstood modernity.

- University. This portion presents a complete and updated review of the courses in History of Town Planning taught by Italian faculty in architecture and humanities departments.

- Regions and Cities. This contains a very useful and detailed bibliography on history of cities in Italy organized by region.

- Methods and Research. This section forms the core of the site and is useful for historical research on the material configuration of the cities and the reconstruction of the design processes within the context of their correct historical perspectives.

- Cities – Middle Ages. History of town planning and archaeology are the two opposite disciplines that meet in the study of medieval cities in Italy. This section, organized by Elisabetta De Minicis, invites and promotes research proposals using this perspective, such as the book series Civitates, edited by Bonsignori, published since 1999.

- Ph.D. in the History of Cities. This section lists Ph.D. candidates, their tutors, their theses, and it indexes their published works.

- Atlases. This section illustrates each edition of the Atlante Storico delle Città Italiane (various editors, since 1986).

- Associations. Storia della Città is also an association formed by more than 100 researchers in Italy and Europe, who specialize in the history of cities.

- Town Planning History. This section focuses on the volumes of Storia dell’urbanistica, edizioni Kappa, Rome, published since 1979.

- Information. Bibliographical news with the complete index of each book presented is published here. An important section is also dedicated to the Conferences organized by the association, such as the Punti di vista e vedute di città Congress, now in its IV and V sessions dedicated to XIX and XX centuries, introduced by Ugo Soragni and Antonella Greco in Rome on April 5th.

- Archival sources. Edited by Donato Tamblé, this section features information on the methods for archival research with particular reference to the State Archive of Rome and other Historical Archives in Italy.

- Vetralla, Museum of the City and of the Territory. The Museum, established in 1992, is an experiment in a new type of museum dedicated to the territory of the Tuscany and its
archaeological discoveries. In 1998, an association called "Vetralla città d'arte" was started within the museum, to protect and enhance the historical, artistic and environmental heritage of the city of Vetralla.

- Finally the site highlights *Tesoro delle Città, Strenna della Associazione Storia della Città*, the annual publication reserved for the members of the most important Italian association of scholars in History of cities and territory, i.e. the International Study Centre for the History of Cities, founded in 1986 and directed by Prof. Enrico Guidoni. Beginning in 2003, forty papers have been published (in first and second editions). These papers reflect the intriguing interests and new methods of the authors, who are mostly young scholars in history of town planning and medieval archaeology.

**The Pewter Society**

[http://www.pewtersociety.org](http://www.pewtersociety.org)

**The Society’s objectives**

The Pewter Society exists to stimulate interest in and appreciation of pewter and the many objects, both utilitarian and decorative, made from this remarkable metal. It does this by:

- encouraging research into the history, manufacture and social context;

- disseminating information through meetings, publications, exhibitions and other appropriate activities;

- advising on its care and conservation.

Whilst our membership includes several leading museums and institutions, most of our members are collectors, some with large and varied collections, others with more modest and specialised ones.

**Meetings**

The Society has two two-day meetings a year, held at varying locations around the UK and running from Saturday lunchtime through to Sunday lunchtime. There are several talks at each meeting. In addition, there is an opportunity for members to show and discuss their recent acquisitions, and to seek advice on pieces of uncertainty. There is also an auction to allow members to sell surplus items from their collections.

Our AGM is held on a Saturday in January in the Pewterers’ Hall in London, and is followed by a short meeting with one or two talks. This is also an excellent opportunity to see the Worshipful Company of Pewterers’ fine collection of both old and new pewter.
In addition, we will normally have one other event during the year, such as a visit to a museum or a joint meeting with a sister society in another country.

**Publications**

We publish an illustrated Journal twice a year containing articles on pewter and its makers. Most of these articles are based on research conducted by our members. For example, there have been articles on Roman pewter, 19th century pewter ice moulds, pewterers recorded in insurance records and fake marks. Copies of the Journal are lodged in a number of libraries.

![Pewter pilgrim souvenir and retainer's badge](image)

Left: A 15 mm high pewter pilgrim souvenir in the form of a vall wearing the inscription 'GRATIA PLENA D(EO)'; excavated from Butler’s Wharf in London. Right: A pewter pilgrim or retainer's badge with twin ostrich feathers above the word ‘AMORE’.

We also publish a Newsletter twice a year. This contains reports of meetings, items of news and reports on sales of pewter.

Finally, we have published a number of books or booklets. These have covered a range of subjects, such as Irish Pewter, books on European pewter marks, London pewterers and candlesticks of the Baroque period. More publications are in the pipeline, and we are also compiling a comprehensive electronic Database of British pewterers.

**Reference material**

The Society has an extensive library of books and other material on British, Continental European and American pewter. It also maintains a reference collection of fakes, and a collection of photographs of examples of antique pewter.

**Web site**

We have a web site located at [www.pewtersociety.org](http://www.pewtersociety.org). This includes a glossary, a simple guide to the various types of pewter marks, a list of our publications, pewter collections that you can visit and other useful information.
Sources of information

The following is a small selection of books about pewter. Some are out-of-print, but most are available as secondhand copies or found in libraries.


To identify marks on UK pewter, the two most useful books are:

**Old Pewter, its Makers and Marks** by H H Cotterell, Batsford 1929 (and later reprints). *The collector’s bible to makers’ marks, though not infallible. Not in print.*


The Museum of Pewter at Harvard House in Stratford-upon-Avon (F +44 (0)1789 204016) has one of the finest and most varied collections of antique pewter in the UK. Other museums in the UK and elsewhere with displays of old pewter are listed on our Web site.

Membership

There are three membership categories:

(1) Associate Membership (£25), for those who want to receive our publications but do not expect to participate actively in the Society or attend meetings regularly (eg because they live outside the UK). A single subscription can cover two people at the same address. Associate Members and their partners can attend meetings occasionally on payment of a small surcharge, but do not have the right to vote.

(2) Full Membership (£32), for those who expect to participate actively in the Society - eg by attending meetings regularly. The subscription only covers one person.
(3) Joint Membership (£40) - as for Full Membership, but covering two people at the same address.

**How to apply**

If you are interested in pewter and would like to join the Society, please e-mail or write to the Secretary. Make sure you indicate which membership category you are interested in. Also, if you have a collection (however modest) or particular interest, please let us know. Your subscription should preferably be paid by sterling cheque made payable to The Pewter Society. If you are unable to pay in sterling, we can accept payment online by Pay Pal, by foreign currency cheque or by direct bank transfer. If payment is made by one of the latter methods, a small surcharge may be added to cover any extra costs. Please contact the Secretary or visit our Web site for further details.

The Secretary is Peter Hayward, Llananant Farm, Penallt, Monmouth NP25 4AP, United Kingdom:
F +44 (0)1600 712864
fax: +44 (0)870 167 4633
e-mail: secretary@pewtersociety.org

All you readers of *Peregrinations* will want to read this book from cover to cover and I promise you will come away from it with a confident grasp of the variety of the forms and figures of pilgrimage. The title suggests an encyclopedic survey of Medieval Literature, and the fact is that the reader will follow a course through a very large domain. Dyas may not have read everything, but her writing demonstrates her knowledge of the more than twelve hundred books listed in the Bibliography. There are a myriad of footnotes.

And the thoughtfulness of the book saves us from clumsy and distracting fumbling with its handling of the notes. We want them all, but their numerosity would have been maddening even collected at the ends of chapters. Appearing at the bottom of the page, they become a kind of *sotto voce* murmur that the reader can attend to as need and inclination prompts. The threads of association embodied in the notes locates the reader in the center of a vast web of relevant information. Praise the lord high publisher.

Her purpose is really double—her sources provide the substance she uses to develop the complex of the variously figured sense and meaning of “pilgrimage” and her orderly mapping of that domain of meaning provides her with a conceptual framework to “read” well known texts in novel and revealing ways. Below I will outline the ordering of the book in just enough detail to give you a general idea of what the book contributes to our collective knowledge. But first I want to describe how reading her book has affected my past and my future as a reader and teacher of Anglo-Saxon poetry.
The prompt is her chapter devoted to the Wanderer and the Seafarer. I have always assumed that it was legitimate to read these poems as imbedded in the Anglo-Saxon heroic tradition. But as an definite imagination what that might mean was only vaguely conceived. Without really being conscious of it, the idea of those two poems reflecting some person’s actual sense of exile and loneliness that somehow got itself articulated in the poetic language of the Anglo-Saxon heroic tradition has always seemed unimaginable if not simply absurd. Was it really possible for a “literate” Anglo-Saxon warrior to wander around Anglo-Saxon England and dream himself into a kind of Caedmonian oral improvisation? And where would he find an audience with a recording scribe who would create a written text that would find its way into the Exeter Book? Or don’t we really need two such persons with profoundly similar experiences? I don’t believe anyone has ever suggested that both poems were created by one person, but isn’t one more likely than two unique persons so alike in their sense of self-identity? If I had brought my assumptions to consciousness, I would have wondered “How I could think such a thing?” But I wasn’t thinking of any kind of actual poet and audience, I was thinking of the Anglo-Saxon poems I had read and was teaching to undergraduates. They loved “The Battle of Maldon” and all the charming gore of Anglo-Saxon and Old Norse heroic legend. Still, I would like to think I have also been unconsciously nagged by the idea that their firm fictional surface could be read as metaphorical figures, that is, fictional representations of mental and spiritual actions. But I could not imagine a context which could support the implicit sense of rhetorical situation, projected self-reflection, and performative speech act.

Dyas does not speculate about production and transmission. Instead she firmly sets the poems in a conceptual and rhetorical context that is monastic rather than secular and is speculative and reflective rather social and personal.

Both poems, therefore can be seen to tap into the essential understanding of earth as exile, life as pilgrimage, and heaven as mankind’s true home. Viewed against the rich complexity of the pilgrimage motif, however, the chief difference in the orientation and purpose of the two poems becomes clear: the Wanderer is an involuntary exile whose story offers a perspective on life to those enduring the enforced vicissitudes of human experience, whereas the Seafarer provides encouragement for those who have already chosen God’s path of self-sacrifice, but are finding the going tough.

There is a charming ending to this story. Dyas’ book appeared in 2001 and so she anticipates Robert E. Bjork’s “Sundor æt Rune: The Voluntary Exile of The Wanderer (in Old English Literature, edited by R. M. Liuzza, Yale UP., 2002). His essay covers the ground so thoroughly that Dyas treats briefly that I do not mean to suggest that he owed her a note of recognition, but I want to give one to Bjork. At the end of his essay he cites my 1974 essay on these poems (W.F. Klein, “Purpose and the ‘Poetics’ of The Wanderer and The Seafarer” in Anglo–Saxon Poetry, p. 218). I wrote: “The ultimate power of human vision is located in a final context of failure . . . the principle of action in [the wanderer] has been brought to contemplative stasis.” Bjork adds, “Obviously I disagree.” (p. 327). The context invoked at the end of the poem is exile as a stage in the comprehensive narrative of the pilgrimage of life whose end is the heavenly kingdom of God. By the tenth century, the idea of the pilgrimage of life had been well developed in the Christian culture centered in monastic tradition.

Obviously I agree with Bjork, and appreciate what Dyas makes clear. In 1974 I needed a comprehensive and richly-detailed idea of the monastic poetic tradition, one that not only
explained the meaning of words and images, but also the play of self in reflection. And thirty years later I still do, and so to the future fruit of Dyas’ book.

I am interested in making sense of the Anglo-Saxon Riddles of the Exeter Book. What is intriguing about them is the subtlety and complexity of their “poetic,” their “forms” and “voices.” They display a wide range of both and certainly involve a highly self-conscious play of wit as well as varieties of impersonation and ventriloquism. The overall complexity of the effect is comparable to the figures Dante, Boccaccio, and Chaucer play in their poetry. On the face of it such perceptions of any Anglo-Saxon poetry would appear to be absurdly anachronistic readings of these ambiguous and puzzling texts. In Dyas’ close reading of the *Seafarer* she points to a number of places where the poet seems to be using ideas and phrases borrowed or influenced by the Psalms. She uses the them as sources and models of forms and “voices” displayed in the poem. Discussing speculation about the genre of the poem, she notes the traditional “elegy” and two others, *planctus* and *meditatio*. And then adds:

Yet, although they may have contributed to the content of the poem, none of these forms entirely solves the problems of structure and tone outlined above. There is another possible source, curiously neglected in *Seafarer* scholarship which would at once supply a model for the pattern of experience described in the poem and demonstrate how such varied emotions could be consistent with the life of one living as a spiritual pilgrim in he world. The source is the Book of Psalms, that most familiar and pervasive of influences in the life of the medieval Christian, used constantly in worship and almost certainly memorized in part or as a whole by anyone possessed of the degree of Christian instruction demonstrated in this poem. (p. 114)

For a novel perspective on the Riddles of the Exeter Book, I don’t expect anything remotely like the close influence she finds in specific details of the *Seafarer*. I would like to have a more general sense of how close familiarity with the Psalms might influence the monastic “poetic.” In her notes she refers to a SUNY publication edited by Nancy Van Deussen, *The Place of the Psalms in the Intellectual Culture of the Middle Ages*, 1999. This book is available online at netlibrary.com. Consulting it led me to Grover Zinn’s “Introduction” and the following:

Whatever the literary/religious origins of the Psalms, for medieval men and women, the Psalms were divinely inspired songs written by King David. The Psalms not only reflected the joy and sadness of David’s own life, with its oscillations between conquest, sickness, betrayal, divine intervention, despair, infidelity, joy, and steadfastness; the Psalms were also seen as a true compendium of Christian theology, words of praise for the Triune God, a sure guide for an upright life, and a vast collection of poetic texts that could become one’s own personal words of prayer in all seasons and conditions of pilgrimage through this life.

I vaguely knew that the Psalms that I had read and heard read all my life were the songs of King David, but the idea did not mean anything. Maybe even less than that. I certainly did not think of their eccentricity, inconsistency their self-pity and petulant resentment as manifestations of an identifiable self. I am still skeptical about my friends who believe they have a perception of the selfhood we name St. Peter and St. Paul. But Zinn’s words made me wonder and a couple of days
later I started reading one of the four copies in Ohio of King Alfred’s Old English Prose Translations of the First Fifty Psalms. It is immediately obvious that these are not translations done with the kind of anxious scruple Aelfric indicated about his Biblical translations, but paraphrases by Alfred of what Alfred thought to be the drift of David’s songs and he summarizes that drift in the brief interpretations and introductions he provides for them. This a person reading poems for intimate personal poetic use. Dee Dyas gives us the sources for the authority of that practice. She quotes Augustine’s Ennarrationes in Psalmos (Discourse on Psalm 30):

If the Psalm prays, you pray; if it laments, you lament; if it rejoices, you rejoice; and if it hopes, you hope; if it fears, you fear. For all things written here are our mirror.

And she suggests that Bede is thinking of Augustine when he writes:

If any oppressive sorrow has come upon you, either by injury brought on by others . . . or by an overwhelming domestic loss, or if you grieve for any reason at all . . . pray with psalms to the Lord lest the sadness of the world which is death swallow you up.

We know that the Riddles appeared in the context of monastic culture, most obviously figured in the person of Aldhelm. But it is also obvious that the riddles display a variety of tones, voices, and forms not rooted in their Latin background. An important thematic center in the Riddles is the process of creation, and the most common fiction in them is giving the individual things of creation distinctive voices engaged in dramatic play with the reader. So I need to have some sense of how the monks read the Psalms. And we have a very obvious and very specific place to go to study exactly that. George Brown (The Place of the Psalms, chapter 1, p 3) marvels at the fact that there are nine paraphrases and glosses of the Gospels and 14 of the Psalms. These glossed Psalters offer a very special opportunity to study the sense of specific words, metaphors and turns of phrase. I will spend my summer studying the Psalters with Anglo-Saxon glosses and return to the Riddles and Riddle scholarship in the fall charged with the anticipation of revelations.

* 

And so we come to the question of what the book as a whole contributes to our knowledge of Medieval English Literature. Divided, as Gaul is reported to have been, into three major sections, Dyas presents an informative and interesting history of the conception of “pilgrimage” first as a general metaphor for the journey of spiritual life and then in a variety of different forms as the metaphor was extended by theological reflection in the early Christian church and complicated by the rise of practical interest in holy places, particularly Jerusalem, and in places made holy by lives of the saints. The first section, “The Origins and Early Development of Christian Pilgrimage, includes discussion of the idea of pilgrimage in the Bible and then three major sources of innovation and elaboration of that idea by the early church, in the writings of Jerome and Augustine in particular, by the rise of the idea of “Holy Places” and the development cult veneration of Saints lives and relics. Chapter 1. “Pilgrimage in the Bible” presents a narrative form of the “Pilgrimage of Life” that ends with Revelation. Dyas concludes this chapter with a statement that anticipates in brief the sense of the rest of the book:
The City, as envisaged by the Apostle, offered peace, comfort and healing in the presence of God, an appropriate goal for weary, foot sore pilgrims, scarred by the trials and temptations of a world in which they could no longer feel at home. It was a picture that gripped the minds of Christian writers during the succeeding centuries. The promise and allure of the heavenly homeland is apparent in patristic sermons, treatises and letters and is woven into a surprising number of Old English poems and prose texts. Middle English artists and writers were equally gripped by the splendours of the heavenly city and the prospect of eternal security. The message of the New Testament helped to shape a world view which set earthly exile against heavenly citizenship, temporary suffering against eternal joy. The decision to live as a penitent, obedient pilgrim on earth would be amply recompensed in the heavenly Jerusalem. That is why an evocation of the joys of the heavenly city makes such an appropriate ending to the Parson’s Tale, a text which advocates such a life of mortal pilgrimage.

As you may have sensed in reading this passage, there are indeed footnotes which refer reader forward to the two following major divisions of the book: Part II: “The Exile and the Heavenly Home in Old English Literature” and Part III: “Parfit Pilgrimage’ or Merely ‘Wandering by the Weye’? Literal and Metaphorical Pilgrimage in Middle English Literature.” These notes take us forward through chapter 10, “The Canterbury Tales.” Dyas’ concluding note about Chaucer is a strong affirmation of the centrality of the Parson’s vision of the Heavenly Jerusalem but “neither ‘mystical’ nor ‘visionary;’ yet the final lines suggest something of the warmth of devotion associated with the contemplative life” (p.198)

Chaucer presents the Parson himself as a role model for an integrated life of teaching and service, ‘riche of hooly thought and werk,’ who practices what he preaches and whose ‘busynesse’ is to ‘drawen folk to hevene by fairnesse’ (General Prologue, 519-20. Here we have the same kind of commitment to the pilgrimage of life as that exemplified by Piers Plowman. Unlike Langland, however, Chaucer does not reject place pilgrimage out of hand. Instead, he places it in the larger context of earthly life, marred by transient relationships, trials and uncertainties, yet also holding out the prospect of the eternal security of heaven. (p. 199)

The standard of an “integrated” vision of living in the world but living in light of the life’s true ending in communion with God and the rest of creation is, of course, Dante’s Divine Comedy. It is hardly escapable to imagine that when Chaucer began The Canterbury Tales, he imagined a world of stories that were indeed integrated in a common vision that would have the moral clarity of “The Parson’s Tale.” But the failure of that project is dramatically evident in the break down of the project as a whole and the poignancy of the Chaucer’s retraction.

The last two chapters of Dyas’ book present two different perspectives on the kinds of pilgrimage she has discussed in the first ten chapters. Chapter 11 is titled “Inner Journeys.” In it she considers “the paradox of inner journeying or ‘interior’ pilgrimage in which progress can only be made by staying still.” (p. 205) The natural home of this kind of pilgrimage is the monastic tradition and its connections with hermit exile, anchoritism, meditation, and mysticism. I presume the body of texts we need to study to gain a wide understanding of how the idea of pilgrimage works in the context of figuring the landscape of the individual soul is enormous.
Dyas chooses to discuss five texts. Three of them are, for me at least, natural choices: the *Ancreme Wisse*, the *Book of Margery Kempe* and the Gawain poet’s *Pearl*. The other two were first time meetings for me: *þe Pilgrimage of þe Lyfe of þe Manhode*, (an anonymous fifteenth century translation of de Deguileville’s *Le Pelerinage de la vie humaine*) and Walter Hilton, the author of *The Scale of Perfection* and some other writings that, according to the online Catholic Encyclopedia were popular in the fifteenth century and are still respected in the Catholic monastic tradition. A summary narrative of the story of the soul’s progress up “the scale of perfection” indicates the metaphorical austerity of the landscape through which the journey traverses. The following is from the Catholic Encyclopedia article:

First printed by Wynkyn de Worde in 1494. This work may be described as a guide-book for the journey to the spiritual Jerusalem, which is "contemplation in perfect love of God." The soul is reformed to the image and likeness of God, first in faith only, and then in faith and in feeling. Speeded by humility and love, it passes through the mystical dark night, which "is nought else but a forbearing and a withdrawing of the thought and of the soul from earthly things by great desire and yearning for to love and see and feel Jesus and spiritual things." By the gift of love all the vices are destroyed, and the soul at length becomes a perfect lover of Jesus, "fully united to Him with softness of love". His presence is the life of the soul, even as the soul is the life of the body. Purified to know His secret voice, its spiritual eyes are opened to see His workings in all things and to behold His blessed nature. Hilton's mystical system is, in the main, a simplification of that of Richard of St. Victor, and, like Richard, he humbly disclaims any personal experience of the Divine familiarity which he describes, declaring that he has not the grace of contemplation himself "in feeling and in working, as I have it in talking." The book is distinguished by beauty of thought and simplicity of expression; it is illustrated by homely, but effective imagery, and in spite of its high spirituality it is full of practical guidance. "A soul," it concludes "that is pure, stirred up by grace to use this working, may see more of such spiritual matter in an hour than can be writ in a great book." It was translated into Latin, as "Speculum Contemplationis," or "Bacculum Contemplationis," by Thomas Fyslawe, a Carmelite.

I think the major reason for Dyas discussing Hilton, and doing so in connection with Bonaventure and Richard Rolle is simply as another illustration of her interest in the transformations and variations one can find of her “theme” of pilgrimage. But the interest does not take us very far into the unique and creative. How far from Dante and Chaucer are we here? It is a sizeable, but measurable distance.

Dyas’ reflections on the two texts that have a strong claim to literary individuality point toward the limits of the thematic study of texts. Inevitably the perception of the texts is focused on the way the text illustrates the general idea of the theme and the aspects of the text that prompt other kinds of interest are set aside. The *Book of Margery Kempe* bristles with signs of Margery Kempe and her story as a very special woman in a very distinct and interesting historical moment. For Dyas, “Margery . . . refused to be bound by the conventional wisdom which, in effect, restricted Christians to enjoying at most two out of the three chief modes of pilgrimage; instead she sought to experience a highly unusual combination of interior, moral and place pilgrimage.” (p. 222) Dyas finds support for her sense of what Margery was doing by citing a current scholar

> The pattern of female spirituality . . . does not divide a woman from herself but integrates her very self, including everything that enters her sphere. She strives not so much for perfection as completion. For woman’s spiritual journey, union includes all that is homely and earthly as well as the mystic and visionary. It includes her essential nature and the contradictions which have been imposed upon her by her society and culture. (p. 223)

She then adds: “Whether her attitude was due to her gender, temperament, lack of theological understanding or overflowing devotion, Margery’s whole tempestuous career was shaped by her desire to simultaneously visit holy places, grow in obedience to God and anticipate the joys of heaven through intimate personal encounters with God.”

The Margery Kempe of Dee Dyas and her associates is really something, a someone I am happy to have met. Dyas’ discussion of *Pearl* does not take into consideration anything suggestive of its feminine consciousness or female spirituality, but I wish she had given it a look. What Dyas reminded me about *Pearl* is the strikingly-odd relationship between the dreamer and the dead daughter who comes in vision to educate the father about the true basis of the alienation that death has brought between them and show him the way to the heavenly vision that will take away the pain of all alienation. The teacher is a female child.

Last year I was dazzled by Edward Condren’s challenging book *The Numerical Universe of the Gawain–Pearl Poet: Beyond Phi* (U. Of Florida, 2002). Condren argues, or perhaps better, displays the wonderously-complex numerical design of the manuscript in which four quite different poems are evidently by the same author. The complex design that Condren discovered creates a ground for considering the theological interplay between all four poems contained in the manuscript.

In a teasing way, I have become fond of suggesting to my students that only a woman could have written *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*. There is the curious appearance of the person of Morgan le Fay in Bercilak’s house, but what I hope to prompt in my students is wonder about the story itself. The story dramatically enacts the stripping from Gawain of the costume of martial chivalry in a highly civilized and Christianized form, and in doing so, reveals that this costume, wonderful and even beautiful in its workmanship, is just a human construction that does nothing but hide the naked mortal who wears it. Being skeptical about knighthood is not uncommon in the fourteenth century, as admirers of Chaucer’s have only recently been forced to know. But there is nothing comic about the revelation. The revelation that Gawain is, at heart, after all, just another human person in need of salvation is comic and utterly forgiving. He is a perfectly nice little man. The similarity of the experience of Pearl’s benighted father is striking. But these are Sunday afternoon professorial meanderings.

Dyas’ last chapter is entitled “Journeying to Jerusalem: An Overview of Literal and Metaphorical Pilgrimage in Middle English Literature.” In the chapter she reviews the ground she has covered but considers it focused on the idea of Jerusalem itself, both real and visionary. I am happy to report that I am one with Dyas on her view of *Pearl*. “The supreme vision of the heavenly Jerusalem in Middle English literature comes in the exquisitely fashioned alliterative poem, *Pearl.*” (p. 243). Yes.

I also am at one with Dyas on which text offers the most delightful guide to the practical concerns with traveling to the earthly city itself. On page 237 we find Dyas citing and
paraphrasing “the *Itineraries* of William Wey, a Fellow of Eton College who traveled to the Holy Land in 1458 and 1462.”

The pilgrim should avoid the lowest part of the ship from Venice which is “ryght evyll & smouldering hote and stinking,” and instead find a place amidships in order to keep ‘his brayne and stomacke in tempre’. That galleys should ever sail safely from Venice to Jaffa seems astonishing if all pilgrims followed the advice to carry not only ‘a lytell cauldron’, a ‘freying panne’, barrels of water and wine, laxatives, restoratives and spices, a cage of chickens and a feather bed. Pilgrims should move swiftly on disembarkation at Jaffa to choose the best mule; they should also watch out for those Saracens who will ‘go talkyng [with] you [and] make gode chere; but thi woll stele from you yf they maye’. (p. 237)

But the tone is not simply comic. Very ominous is the warning about the danger of eating unfamiliar food: “They gender a blody fluxe; and yf an Englyschmann have that sykenes hyt is a mervel and scape hit but he dye therof.’

For the most part Dee Dyas keeps us pilgrim readers on the straight and narrow path that leads from the land of not-knowing to the territory of the known, but she is capable of a bit of “wandering by the way. As the mother cow said to her calf, “Don’t eschew stopping now and then to eat a flower.”

William Klein
Professor of English
Kenyon College
kleinw@kenyon.edu

Therese Martin, University of Arizona

The objective of this symposium was to address the historical significance of the late eleventh-century church of San Martín de Frómista and to weigh the results of its polemical restoration, completed one hundred years ago. This building has been alternatively considered a paradigm of the Romanesque style and held up as the most perfect surviving example of architecture on the Pilgrimage Road to Santiago de Compostela, or ridiculed as a nineteenth-century pastiche whose historical importance was destroyed by over-restoration. The symposium was organized by José Manuel Rodríguez Montañés of the Fundación Santa María la Real. Rodríguez Montañés is also editing the volume in which the symposium proceedings will appear. Publication is said to be imminent.

Six scholars were invited to give hour-long talks on various aspects of San Martín and its restoration. [The presentations were made in Spanish, but for this review, I will give English translations of the titles.] The first day was devoted to the monastery’s historical context. Frómista holds pride of place among Spanish buildings as one of the earliest incarnations of the mature Romanesque style and the first manifestation of sculpture by the so-called Orestiad Master, whose influence scholars such as Serafín Moralejo have traced to sites throughout northern Spain and southern France. Santiago Peral Villafruela, Historian of the Ayuntamiento de Frómista, spoke on “Frómista and San Martín in the Middle Ages: A Conflicted Relationship.” Using medieval documentary sources, Peral Villafruela traced the history of San Martín and its often uneasy interactions with the town of Frómista that grew up around the monastery. José Luis Senra Gabriel y Galán of the Universidad de Santiago de Compostela presented his research entitled “The Material Reality of the Church of San Martín de Fromista in the Twelfth Century.” He drew a convincing connection between Frómista and the nearby Benedictine monastery of San Zoilo de Carrión de los Condes, expounding his theory that the west facades of both originally consisted of two-story “galilees.” Therese Martin of the University of Arizona concluded the first day’s presentations with her “Crouching Monsters, Apes, and Orestes: The Sculptural Context of San Martín de Frómista.” Following the career of the “Orestiad Master” from Frómista to Jaca, León, and Compostela, she addressed issues related to Romanesque sculpture, including its public nature,
the varied representations of lust on church facades, and the overlapping iconography of Samson, David and Hercules.

The following day focused on the restoration of the church undertaken by Aníbal Alvarez in the late nineteenth century and completed in 1904. Due to the radical nature of the restoration, in which most of the masonry was removed and replaced, and to its poor documentation of such matters as the extent of the sculpture to be substituted, Frómista’s restoration continues to be one of the most controversial in Spain’s history. Pedro Navascués Palacio of the Escuela Superior de Arquitectura de Madrid opened the day’s talks with his “Theory and Practice of Restoration around the year 1900.” His learned and highly engaging presentation placed Frómista’s restoration within the context of work done in Europe in the late nineteenth century, showing various examples of the excessive (to our eyes) repairs then being done on medieval architecture. He was followed by José Luis Hernando Garrido of the Escuela Superior de Conservación y Restauración de Bienes Culturales de Madrid, whose talk was entitled “The Social, Political, and Cultural Context of the Intervention at San Martín de Frómista.” Hernando Garrido looked beyond the question of architecture to recreate the historical moment within which Frómista’s restoration was undertaken, focusing particularly on the interactions of political and religious figures who promoted the restoration. Finally, Pedro Luis Gallego Fernández of the Escuela Técnica Superior de Arquitectura de Valladolid closed the symposium with “Aníbal Alvarez and the Restoration of San Martín de Frómista” with a close examination of the surviving documentary evidence. He reviewed early groundplans and the little that is known of Alvarez’s notes, and he drew conclusions from the changes evident in a comparison of Parcerisa’s nineteenth-century engraving of the monastery with early twentieth-century photographs.

Following each set of presentations, there were lively discussions among the speakers and symposium attendees, summaries of which are to be included in the publication of the proceedings. The international audience included scholars and graduate students from Spain, Germany, the United States, and Italy, along with residents of Frómista who were curious to see what the speakers would make of their beloved local monument. There was much conviviality among the speakers and organizers of the symposium, at which meals were an important venue for continuing discussions of the often controversial conclusions of the presentations. In the end, all agreed that San Martín is ripe for further study, and especially urgent is the need to determine which sculptural and architectural elements are original and which are the result of the restoration. The afternoons brought visits to San Martín itself, and to the nearby churches of San Hipólito de Támara and San Zoilo de Carrión de los Condes, the former undergoing restoration, and the latter closely related to San Martín de Frómista in the twelfth century.

Support for the symposium was provided by the Fundación del Patrimonio Histórico de Castilla y León, the Ayuntamiento de Frómista, the Junta de Castilla y León, Caja España, Caja Duero, Caja de Burgos, Caja Círculo, Caja Segovia, Caja de Avila, and the Samuel H. Kress Foundation.
Architecture on the Pilgrimage Road to Santiago de Compostela

Born in Kansas, William J. Smither attended Wichita State University, the U. of Kansas, Wisconsin, and Tulane University where he received the Ph.D. in 1952. After teaching Spanish and Portuguese at Tulane for 35 years he retired as emeritus professor in 1982. During that period he also served as Director of the Language Laboratory and as Acting Dean of Newcomb College (Sophie Newcomb Memorial College of Tulane U.). Besides articles, reviews, and research in second language teaching, he published *El Mundo Gallego de Valle-Inclán* in 1986. Medieval Spanish studies at Wisconsin and subsequent interest in the Santiago pilgrimage as an element of Spanish culture, civilization, and art led to extensive photography, some of which was used in one of Smither's courses.
Puente la Reina Bridge
Puente la Reina, Spain
Photographer: W.J. Smither

The town of Puente la Reina
Puente la Reina, Spain
Photographer: W.J. Smither
The archivolt entrance, west façade,
Church of Santiago
Puente la Reina, Spain
Photographer: W.J. Smither
Detail of the left side of the west entrance, Church of Santiago
Puente la Reina, Spain
Photographer: W.J. Smither
Detail of the left side of the west entrance, Church of Santiago, illustrating combat
Puente la Reina, Spain
Photographer: W.J. Smither
Detail of the left side of the west entrance, Church of Santiago, sculpture and column capitals
Puente la Reina, Spain
Photographer: W.J. Smither
Detail of the sculpture from the Archivolt entrance, west façade of the Church of Santiago Puente la Reina, Spain
Photographer: W.J. Smither